

COMPILATION OF COMMENTS FOR REVIEW OF MC&I(Forest Plantations) – COMMENTS RECEIVED FROM FIRST 60-DAY PUBLIC COMMENT

General Comments

Proposal for Amendment/ Deletion/ Addition	Comment	Respondent Name
General Comments	<p>Principle 5 & 6</p> <p>We hope that Principle 5 on Benefits form the forest and Principle 6 on Environmental Impact will be enforced and monitored accordingly to all certificate's applicant. This is to ensure all related development will comply with environmental regulations and take the necessary precautions in order to ensure that the risks and impact of environmental pollution can be reduced.</p>	Iskandar Regional Development Authority
General Comments	<p>Whilst we are not completely against Forest Plantations as a reliable and continuous source of timber for the Malaysian Timber industry and its downstream industry for the economic well-being of Malaysia and its citizens. We cannot support the Plan, if:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Clearing of existing forest reserve to convert into Forest Plantation 2) Tropical Forest Plantation cannot be equated with temperate countries forest plantation where the biodiversity of the later is much less when compared to our tropical forest. Hence the difference in Biodiversity in Temperate countries Forest Plantation with natural forest is much less. 3) The present unbridled clearing of natural forest, whether degraded, protected or otherwise, for forest plantation is not acceptable and may be an economic and/or environmental disaster, until a more complete and prolong studies on a much reduce scale of forest plantation is completed. Example, extensive hill slope planting of Timber Latex Clone (TLC), at times on steep hill slope. The suitability and manpower to tap the rubber trees on steep hill slopes. 4) Sustainable logging of tropical forest should be maintain to provide a continuous and reliable source of tropical hard-wood which cannot be equated with for example, TLC. 5) Malaysia record of forest plantation had so far not been successful for a myriad of reasons including the non-suitable climate for exotic or non-native timber. Maintenance of forest plantation can be better. 6) The present rate of conversion to TLC is also not advisable as if there is any significant drop of rubber price, rubber production have to be reduced. 7) At Branch level (MNS Penang) members during trips to Kedah, Perak, and a lesser extent Kelantan have seen extensive forest clearing (mainly for TLC), at the following locations, Gunung Inas FR, (Bkt Palong, Lata Celak, Kemangi) Pedu-Muda areas, Sik Area (near Lata Mengkuang) Bukit Peranginan FR, all in Kedah. We had seen extensive forest clearing at the Kupang – Gerik highway, involving, Bintang Hijau FR, Bkt Kenderong FR, and Hulu Semang FR, and also at Pondok Tanjung FR. Scant regard were paid to the maintenance of riparian zone and also the pollution of river source to now stream villages. Further a field, in Kelantan land clearing along the Banding – Hutan Melintang section of the East West highway. Habitats of Elephants, Tapirs, Hornbill, endangered and threatened species were probably not taken into consideration in EIA reports that we have examined. 8) Until and unless a complete and systematic review of existing clearing of forest for Forest Plantation is carried out, further clearing should be halted immediately. 9) Forest Plantation should be on already cleared or degraded forests that were classified as such before say 1995. It is of no use if present forests were cleared and international or regional organization or buyers do not accept these areas as sustainable Forest Plantation. 	MNS Penang Branch
General Comments	<p>1. Nomenclature</p> <p>Proposal for consideration to name the standard as MC&I (Planted Forest) instead of MC&I (Forest Plantations)</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1.1 To be consistent with sister standard MC&I (Natural Forest) nomenclature 1.2 To provide clear and unequivocal description of land use and mission of intended certification 1.3 To contribute to the rationalization of the greater forest certification framework, regional differences, and stages of forest plantation development (particularly for Sarawak) in Malaysia, 	Zedtee Sdn Bhd

Proposal for Amendment/ Deletion/ Addition	Comment	Respondent Name
General Comments	<p>2. Need for Rationalization</p> <p>2.1 Hierarchy of land use planning and management There should be a logical hierarchy of land use planning and management between the nation, state, FMU, LPF, PL etc. The peninsular FMUs covering all the PFE in the state would logically occupy a higher level of planning and management over a "forest plantation" which constitutes only a fraction of its area.</p> <p>2.2 MC&I (Forest Plantations) is pre-occupied with the conversion of natural forest into planted forests. By attaching Principle 10 as an appendage to the largely unabridged MC&I (2002), it surreptitiously compelled the plantation forest manager to manage/certify the whole FMU! As is, MC&I (Forest Plantations) is tailored to suit peninsular FMUs for the certification of their PFEs including existing and planned forest plantations whereby MC&I (Natural Forest) would become superfluous. On the other hand, it is noteworthy that a Sabah FMUs consisting mainly of severely degraded forests and managed primarily for planting rubber could be certified against MC&I (2002) instead of MC&I (Forest Plantation)! With so much overlapping commonality and interchangeability between the standards, the obvious solution based on a logical framework approach would be the unification into only one standard, for example, MC&I (Forest Management) to cover both land uses and development, and nesting Planted forest management plan as a sub-section of the forest management plan.</p> <p>2.3 Relative importance and relevance oi the same set of Principles and Criteria between the two standards over space and time. Criterion 6.10 "Forest conversion to plantations ..." in MC&I (Natural Forest) may be reasonable. Its replication in MC&I (Forest Plantations) for "planted" forest is illogical. This peculiar situation would not arise in a "unified" standard for the assessment of a holistically planned and managed FMU or its equivalent.</p> <p>2.4 Need for a standard dedicated to "PLANTED" forest; which is not part of FMU certified under MC&I (Natural Forest). There are 45 LPFs in Sarawak under various stages of development and readiness for harvest. All principal stakeholders and key industry players are now ready to concede that certification of the planted forests may be an insurance to safeguard the investments against potential trade barriers imposed on tropical timber by consuming countries. There is thus a pressing need to formulate a standard dedicated to "Planted Forest" which is not part of FMU certified under MC&I (Natural Forest) as in Peninsular Malaysia. The present review of MC&I (Forest Plantations) should therefore cater for what had been PLANTED and planned for now, and prepare the foundation for an eventual unified standard that could be used for the whole spectrum of land uses within a specific landscape</p>	Zedtee Sdn Bhd
General Comments	<p>3. Standard Review Procedure/Process</p> <p>Unfortunately, there is a strong perception among the industry, particularly from Sarawak, that the present standard review procedure had not been able to adequately cater for industry participation and input for the review of the standard. The review of MC&I (Forest Plantations) would therefore also be an opportunity to refine the state of art of the review procedure/process for it to be more inclusive and democratic. In the meantime, review of the standard should strive to produce a MC&I (Planted Forest) that could be used by planted forest managers with imminent needs to placed planted timber onto the markets, The review should also consider the merit of a unified standard and devise a plan for their integration.</p>	Zedtee Sdn Bhd

Proposal for Amendment/ Deletion/ Addition	Comment	Respondent Name
General Comments	<p>4. General comments/“suggestions on the proposed MC&I (Planted Forest)</p> <p>4.1 Precise and un-ambiguous definition of management area <i>vis-a-vis</i> FMU for natural forest</p> <p>4.1.1 The status and objective of the area for management should be declared as soon as possible (say, "Plantation Forest Management Area") to distinguish it from FMU.</p> <p>4.1.2 PFMA necessarily delineates a multiple use landscape subject of legal frameworks of different regions of Malaysia.</p> <p>In Sarawak, the LPF areas most aptly represent this model whereby land uses may include Protection Areas, natural forests unsuitable for conversion, conversion areas (industrial timber trees), non-tree (oil palm) areas, and community use areas.</p> <p>In Sabah, the FMUs may be considered as the equivalent of LPF in Sarawak.</p> <p>In Peninsular Malaysia, the forest plantation is a subset of land use (by conversion of the PFE?) within the FMU. We are unaware of any guideline for the identification of conversion areas, and extent of responsibility required of the plantation manager over the surrounding landscape beyond the demarcated plantation boundary.</p> <p>4.2 Provision for assessment based on the stage of development ranging from natural forest, planned plantation, and planted forest and a combination of all three stages over space and time</p> <p>The demarcation and maintenance of Protection Areas like HCvFs and SBRs may be the only constant within a PFMA. There would be rapid changes in land use and requirement for adaptive responses to changed circumstances during the development phase of PFM.</p> <p>There may be a gap between the Protection Areas and Conversion Areas. In Sarawak, the LPF licensee carried out silvicultural treatment of trees from areas not suitable for conversion pending approval from the authority for "enrichment" planting.</p> <p>4.3 Provision for clear differentiation of responsibility between forest manager and plantation manager. This may be achieved by manifesting plantation management as a subset of the forest management plan.</p> <p>Remove repetitious and cross-referenced PC&Is resulting from the hegemony of a certain special interest group.</p>	Zedtee Sdn Bhd
General Comments	<p>Logical Framework for Principles and Criteria</p> <p>This proposal is made with the assumption that the Ps & Cs are not sacrosanct and immutable in view of the repetitions and cross references. In fact, the apparent complexity of the standard could easily be resolved if there is no hegemony of principles by a particular stakeholder group, and that the criteria and indicators so identified could be organized under a logical framework for practical application.</p>	Zedtee Sdn Bhd
General Comments	<p>P1 (Compliance with laws...) and P2's (Tenure and use rights...) roles and positions are not contestable as they provide the legal frameworks [or the relevant land use in the first instance</p>	Zedtee Sdn Bhd

Principle 1

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text / Amendment	Respondent Name
P1				Add	<i>plantation, ... of Malaysia</i>	To add in "plantation" as this is the standard for Forest Plantation and "of Malaysia" for clarity	Forest plantation management shall respect all applicable laws of Malaysia and international treaties and agreements to which Malaysia is a signatory, and comply with all the Principles and Criteria contained herein.	Sarawak Timber Association
P1	C1.1			Add	<i>plantation</i>	To add in "plantation" as this is the standard for Forest Plantation	Forest plantation management shall respect all federal and state laws and administrative requirements.	Sarawak Timber Association
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia	Amend	<i>The Protection of Wildlife Act, 1972 to Wildlife Conservation Act 2010 (Act 716)</i>	Wildlife Conservation Act 2010 (Act 716) is a newly gazetted Act replacing the Protection of Wildlife Act, 1972.	Wildlife Conservation Act 2010 (Act 716)	PERHILITAN
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia	Add	<u>Federal Law:</u> - <i>EPF Act</i> - <i>Industrial Relations Act</i>	EPF and Industrial Relations Act not included		MTUC Sarawak Division
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia	Add	<u>State Law:</u> - <i>State Ordinances relating to labour</i>	State Ordinances not included		MTUC Sarawak Division
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia	Add	<u>Policies:</u> - <i>National Wage Consultative Council 2011</i> - <i>National Minimum Retirement Age 2012</i>	New Act		MTUC Sarawak Division
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia	Amend	<i>Protection of Wildlife Act, 1972 to Wildlife Conservation Act 2010</i>		Wildlife Conservation Act 2010	WCS-Malaysia Program
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>National Physical Plan 2, 2010</i> <i>National Timber Industry Policy, 2009-2020</i> 	Add new existing policy	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>National Physical Plan 2, 2010</i> <i>National Timber Industry Policy, 2009-2020</i> 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia	Amend	<u>Federal Laws</u> <i>Environmental Quality (Scheduled Wastes) Regulations, 1989 to Regulations of the Environmental Quality (Scheduled Wastes) Regulations 2005.</i>	The rule have been cancelled and replaced with a new rule.	Regulations of the Environmental Quality (Scheduled Wastes) Regulations 2005.	Jabatan Alam Sekitar Sarawak

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text / Amendment	Respondent Name
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia	Add	<i>International Trade of Endangered Species Act 2008, Malaysian Quarantine Inspection Services 2011; Include: National Physical Plan 2, Central Forest Spine-1 and Central Forest Spine-2, Suggest to add: Timber Legality Assurance Scheme (TLAS)</i>	Updated act	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Endangered Species Act 2008 Malaysian Quarantine Inspection Services 2011 National Physical Plan 2 Central Forest Spine-1 Central Forest Spine-2 Timber Legality Assurance Scheme (TLAS) 	WWF
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia	Amend	<i>Wildlife Act, 1972 to Wildlife Conservation Act, 2010</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Wildlife Conservation Act, 2010 	WWF
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia	Amend	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> National Forestry Policy, 1978 National Agriculture Policy, 1992-2010 National Policy on Biological Diversity, 1998 National Policy on Environment, 2002 	All these policies are currently undergoing review and may not be applicable in the near future. As such it is recommended that "or the latest version of these policies" is added as a clause in the verifier section.		WWF
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>National Wages Consultative Council Act 2011 (Act 732)</i>	In accordance with the enforcement of minimum wage for workers set at RM900.00 for Peninsular Malaysia and RM800.00 for Sabah and Sarawak from January 1, 2013	National Wages Consultative Council Act 2011 (Act 732)	Jabatan Tenaga Kerja Semenanjung Malaysia
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<u>Federal Laws</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Environmental Quality (Scheduled Wastes) Regulations, 1989</i> 	To change the year from 1989 to 2005. The regulation has been updated (REPEALED BY PU(A) 294/2005)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Environmental Quality (Scheduled Wastes) Regulations, 2005 	KTS Forests Management
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Standards Act – Minimum Standards of Housing and Amenities Act 1990 (Act 446)</i>	The objective of this act is intended to set minimum standards of housing and child care centre for employees and their dependents to require allot land for cultivation and grazing in a place of employment, to require employers to provide health facilities, hospitals, medical and social and to provide for matters incidental thereto.	Standards Act – Minimum Standards of Housing and Amenities Act 1990 (Act 446)	Jabatan Tenaga Kerja Semenanjung Malaysia

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text / Amendment	Respondent Name
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Minimum Retirement Age Act 2012</i>	In accordance with the enforcement of the minimum age of retirement from July 1, 2013	Minimum Retirement Age Act 2012	Jabatan Tenaga Kerja Semenanjung Malaysia
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Anti-Trafficking in Persons and Anti-Smuggling of Migrants Act (Act 270)</i>	To curb smuggling and trafficking activities (forced labour)	Anti-Trafficking in Persons and Anti-Smuggling of Migrants Act (Act 270)	Jabatan Tenaga Kerja Semenanjung Malaysia
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Delete	<i>National Agricultural Policy, 1992-2010</i>	Not applicable for forest plantation		Sarawak Timber Association
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Sabah	Add	<u>Federal Law:</u> - <i>EPF Act</i> - <i>Industrial Relations Act</i>	EPF and Industrial Relations Act not included		MTUC Sarawak Division
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Sabah	Add	<u>State Law:</u> - <i>State Ordinances relating to labour</i>	State Ordinances not included		MTUC Sarawak Division
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Sabah	Add	<u>Policies:</u> - <i>National Wage Consultative Council 2011</i> - <i>National Minimum Retirement Age 2012</i>	New Act		MTUC Sarawak Division
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Sabah	Amend	<i>Sabah Forest Policy, 1954 to Sabah Forest Policy, 2005</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Sabah Forest Policy, 2005 	WWF
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Sabah	Add	<i>Environment Protection (Prescribed Activities) (Environmental Impact Assessment) Order, 2012, Interpretation (definition of native) Ordinance Cap. 64</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Environment Protection (Prescribed Activities) (Environmental Impact Assessment) Order, 2012 Interpretation (definition of native) Ordinance Cap. 64 	WWF
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Sarawak	Add	<u>Federal Law:</u> - <i>EPF Act</i> - <i>Industrial Relations Act</i>	EPF and Industrial Relations Act not included		MTUC Sarawak Division
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Sarawak	Add	<u>State Laws:</u> - <i>State Ordinances relating to labour</i>	State Ordinances not included		MTUC Sarawak Division
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Sarawak	Add	<u>Policies:</u> - <i>National Wage Consultative Council 2011</i> - <i>National Minimum Retirement Age 2012</i>	New Act New Act		MTUC Sarawak Division

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text / Amendment	Respondent Name
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Sarawak	Amend	<i>Supplementary Regulations Environmental Quality (Clean Air) Regulations, 1978 to Regulations of the Environmental Quality (Clean Air) Regulations 1978 included the above regulations the Environmental Quality (Scheduled Wastes) Regulations 2005.</i>	Fuel burner as power (generator sets) are subject to the rule - the Environmental Quality (Clean Air) Regulations 1978 to obtain written consent from the Department of Environment.	Regulations of the Environmental Quality (Clean Air) Regulations 1978 included the above regulations the Environmental Quality (Scheduled Wastes) Regulations 2005.	Jabatan Alam Sekitar Sarawak
P1	C1.1	I1.1.1	Sarawak	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ <i>Occupational Safety and Health (Notification of Accident, Dangerous Occurrence, Occupational Poisoning and Occupational Diseases) Regulations, 2004</i> ● <i>Minimum Wages Order 2012</i> ● <i>Minimum Retirement Age Act 2012</i> 	Adoption of Verifiers from MC&I (Natural Forest) To add in Minimum Wages Order 2012 and Minimum Retirement Age Act 2012 with the recent addition inlaws	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Occupational Safety and Health (Notification of Accident, Dangerous Occurrence, Occupational Poisoning and Occupational Diseases) Regulations, 2004 ● Minimum Wages Order 2012 ● Minimum Retirement Age Act 2012 	Sarawak Timber Association
P1	C1.1	I1.1.2		Delete	<i>administrative requirements</i>	To delete 'administrative requirements' as adopted from MC&I (Natural Forest)		Sarawak Timber Association
P1	C1.1	I1.1.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<i>Discussion with ... and relevant stakeholders to Record and outcome of</i>	The word 'discussion' does not indicate proofs. Therefore use 'record and outcome of interview to show evidence.	Record and outcome of interview with Forest Plantation Manager on the applicable federal, state and local laws as well as the regulatory framework	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P1	C1.1	I1.1.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<i>Record and outcome of interview with Forest Manager on the applicable federal, state and local laws as well as the regulatory framework</i>	Adoption of Verifiers from MC&I (Natural Forest)		Sarawak Timber Association
P1	C1.1	I1.1.3	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>forest</i>	To add 'forest' for clarity	Records of forest offences and actions taken	Sarawak Timber Association
P1	C1.1	I1.2.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<i>List of rent and fees payable, royalty structure and rates to</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>National Forestry Act, 1984</i> ● <i>State Forest Enactments</i> ● <i>State Forest Rules - Second Schedule (premium rate), Third Schedule (royalty rate), Fourth Schedule (forest premium and cess) and Fifth Schedule (liquidated damages)</i> 	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● National Forestry Act, 1984 ● State Forest Enactments ● State Forest Rules - Second Schedule (premium rate), Third Schedule (royalty rate), Fourth Schedule (forest premium and cess) and Fifth Schedule (liquidated damages) 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text / Amendment	Respondent Name
P1	C1.1	I1.5.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<i>Records of monitoring and actions taken to</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Evidence of control measures (e.g. signage, boundaries demarcation, etc.)</i> <i>Records of actions taken and copies of reports to relevant authorities</i> <i>National Forestry Act, 1984 — Sections 15, 32, 47, 50, 81, 82 and 86</i> <i>State Forest Enactments</i> 	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Evidence of control measures (e.g. signage, boundaries demarcation, etc.) Records of actions taken and copies of reports to relevant authorities National Forestry Act, 1984 — Sections 15, 32, 47, 50, 81, 82 and 86 State Forest Enactments 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P1	C1.2	I1.2.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Financial reports on prescribed fees, royalties, taxes and other charges being paid;</i> <i>Data base for such payment should be developed</i> 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Financial reports on prescribed fees, royalties, taxes and other charges being paid; Data base for such payment should be developed 	WWF
P1	C1.3	I1.3.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<i>reflected to included</i>		Where relevant, provisions related to forest plantation management of the following binding international agreements are included in forest plantation management plan and in forest plantation management:	MNS Penang Branch
P1	C1.3	I1.3.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Essence of international agreement must be incorporated in the forest management plan</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Essence of international agreement must be incorporated in the forest management plan 	WWF
P1	C1.5			Add	<i>But shall allow reasonable public access for NGO for monitoring and access to forest reserve nearby. Including access for eco-tourism and possible recreational forest reserve.</i>		Forest management areas shall be protected from illegal harvesting, settlement and other unauthorized activities but shall allow reasonable public access for NGO for monitoring and access to forest reserve nearby. Including access for eco-tourism and possible recreational forest reserve.	MNS Penang Branch
P1	C1.5			Add	<i>... plantation ... unit</i>	Forest management areas replaced by Forest plantation management unit as stipulated in the key definitions of important terms used in the MC&I (Forest Plantations)(page 35 of the standard)	Forest plantations management unit shall be protected from illegal harvesting, settlement and other unauthorized activities.	Sarawak Timber Association

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text / Amendment	Respondent Name
P1	C1.5			Delete	areas	Forest management areas replaced by Forest plantation management unit as stipulated in the key definitions of important terms used in the MC&I (Forest Plantations)(page 35 of the standard)	Forest plantations management unit shall be protected from illegal harvesting, settlement and other unauthorized activities.	Sarawak Timber Association
P1	C1.5	I1.5.1	Peninsular Malaysia	Add	<i>The Protection of Wildlife Act, 1972 to Wildlife Conservation Act 2010 (Act 716)</i>	For protection of wildlife related offences	Wildlife Conservation Act 2010 (Act 716)	PERHILITAN
P1	C1.5	I1.5.1	Peninsular Malaysia	Add	<i>Wildlife Conservation Act 2010</i>		Wildlife Conservation Act 2010	WCS-Malaysia Program
P1	C1.5	I1.5.1	Sarawak	Add	<i>Wild Life Protection Ordinance, 1998 (Cap. 26) And sub-verifier Wild Life Protection Rules, 1998</i>		Wild Life Protection Ordinance, 1998 (Cap. 26) o Wild Life Protection Rules, 1998	WCS-Malaysia Program
P1	C1.5	I1.5.1	Sarawak	Add	<i>Wildlife Protection Ordinance, 1998 (Cap. 26)</i>	Adoption of Verifiers from MC&I (Natural Forest)		Sarawak Timber Association
P1	C1.5	I1.5.2		Add	<i>... in the Forest Plantation Management Unit</i>	Addition is to clarify sentence	Control of encroachment, illegal harvesting, hunting, fishing and settlement, and other unauthorized activities in the Forest Plantation Management Unit	Sarawak Timber Association
P1	C1.5	I1.5.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>System of monitoring/control implemented</i>		System of monitoring/control implemented	WCS-Malaysia Program
P1	C1.6			Add	<i>plantation</i>	To add in 'plantation' as this is the standard for Forest Plantation	Forest plantation managers shall demonstrate a long-term commitment to adhere to these Principles and Criteria.	Sarawak Timber Association
P1	C1.6	I1.6.1		Add	<i>The policies or statements of commitments must be developed, documented and distributed. Documents must be made available to public in the website, and hard copy is available when requested.</i>		Availability of policies or statements of commitment to forest plantation management practices consistent with these Principles and Criteria. The policies or statements of commitments must be developed, documented and distributed. Documents must be made available to public in the website, and hard copy is available when requested.	WWF
P1	C1.6	I1.6.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<i>Record to Written</i>	Enhance Verifier 'Records or statements of such commitment' with proposed wording.	Written policies or statements of such commitment through poster or banner.	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text / Amendment	Respondent Name
P1	C1.6	I1.6.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Evidence of distribution of policy statement to stakeholders.</i>	This matter have been implemented by JPSM but never been mentioned.	Evidence of distribution of policy statement to stakeholders.	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P1	C2.2	I2.2.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Mechanism for collaboration/consultation set up</i>		Mechanism for collaboration/consultation set up	WCS-Malaysia Program

Principle 2

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P2	C2.1	I2.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Records of gazettement of Permanent Reserved Forest (PRF) Entry permits Road permits Usage permits 	This matter have been implemented by SFD but never been mentioned.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Records of gazettement of Permanent Reserved Forest (PRF) Entry permits Road permits Usage permits 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P2	C2.1	I2.1.1	Sarawak	Delete	Land title	To delete "Land title" as it is covered in Land Code, 1958 (Cap. 81)		Sarawak Timber Association
P2	C2.1	I2.1.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	... "within Forest Plantation management unit, if any"	To clarify the sentence	Records of participation in the resolution of land claims within Forest plantation management unit, if any.	Sarawak Timber Association
P2	C2.2	I2.2.1		Add	... if any	Adoption from MC&I (Natural Forest)	Availability of documentation, if any of legal or customary tenure or use rights of local communities within relevant federal and state legal frameworks for the forest plantation area.	Sarawak Timber Association
P2	C2.2	I2.2.1	Peninsular Malaysia	Add	The Protection of Wildlife Act, 1972 to Wildlife Conservation Act 2010 (Act 716)	Section 51, in Addition: Wildlife Conservation Act 2010 (Act 716) has mentioned about general exceptions for Aborigine may hunt certain wildlife	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Wildlife Conservation Act 2010 (Act 716) 	PERHILITAN
P2	C2.2	I2.2.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<p>Records of collaboration to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Records of such collaboration, including participation in the resolution of land claims, if any Records of consultations held with the local communities I indigenous peoples to identify and document areas traditionally used and sites of significant importance to them, if any (e.g. cultural, religious sites, water intake point) Records of actions taken to protect the identified sites of significant importance ,if any (e.g. cultural, religious sites, water intake point) 	Enhance Verifier with clearer evidence.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Records of such collaboration, including participation in the resolution of land claims, if any Records of consultations held with the local communities I indigenous peoples to identify and document areas traditionally used and sites of significant importance to them, if any (e.g. cultural, religious sites, water intake point) Records of actions taken to protect the identified sites of significant importance ,if any (e.g. cultural, religious sites, water intake point) 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P2	C2.3	I2.3.1	Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	if any to the end of every sentence	Adoption from MC&I (Natural Forest)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Records of outcomes of direct negotiations or arbitration, if any Records of decisions of Native Courts, if any Records of decisions of Civil Courts, if any Records of disputes over tenure and use rights are maintained, if any 	Sarawak Timber Association

Principle 3

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P3				General		P3 should be "Environmental Impact" which is the essential/prescribed procedure to establish baseline and prerequisite for subsequent management. HCVMs and Protection Areas should be identified at this stage. (Sarawak LPFs require EIA to be carried out before FMP and commencement of work)		Zedtee Sdn Bhd
P3	C3.1			Add	<i>if any to the end of the sentence</i>	Adoption from MC&I (Natural Forest)	Availability of documentation of the customary rights of indigenous peoples' lands within relevant federal, state and local laws, if any.	Sarawak Timber Association
P3	C3.1	I3.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia	Amend	<i>Records of customary rights of indigenous peoples' lands under the Aboriginal Peoples Act, 1954 to</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Records of customary rights of aborigines lands under the Aboriginal Peoples Act, 1954 - Sections 2, 3, 6, 7, 8, 10, 11, 12 and 19</i> <i>Maps of Aboriginal Reserve</i> <i>Records of consultations with the aborigines</i> 	Enhance Verifier with clearer evidence.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Records of customary rights of aborigines lands under the Aboriginal Peoples Act, 1954 - Sections 2, 3, 6, 7, 8, 10, 11, 12 and 19 Maps of Aboriginal Reserve Records of consultations with the aborigines 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P3	C3.1	I3.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Claims complied at public inquiry by Suhakam 2012 for all regions</i>		Claims complied at public inquiry by Suhakam 2012	WCS-Malaysia Program
P3	C3.1	I3.1.1	Sarawak	Add	<i>Records of consultations with the natives</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Records of consultations with the natives 	Sarawak Timber Association
P3	C3.1	I3.1.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<i>Records of delegation of power by indigenous people to</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Records of consultations with representatives of aborigines/natives</i> 	Enhance Verifier with clearer evidence.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Records of consultations with representatives of aborigines/natives 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P3	C3.1	I3.1.3	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Mechanism established for consultation/dialogue for all regions</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Mechanism established for consultation/dialogue</i> 	WCS-Malaysia Program

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P3	C3.1	I3.1.3	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Records of outcomes of direct negotiations or arbitration Records of decisions of Civil Courts Records of conflicts and grievances between parties involved to <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Records of conflicts and grievances between parties involved concerning their legal and customary rights within the forest plantation areas, if any Records of outcomes by direct negotiations or arbitration concerning their legal and customary rights within the forest plantation area, if any Records of decisions of Civil Courts concerning their legal and customary rights within the forest plantation areas, if any 	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Records of conflicts and grievances between parties involved concerning their legal and customary rights within the forest plantation areas, if any Records of outcomes by direct negotiations or arbitration concerning their legal and customary rights within the forest plantation area, if any Records of decisions of Civil Courts concerning their legal and customary rights within the forest plantation areas, if any 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P3	C3.1	I3.1.3	Sabah/ Sarawak	Delete	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Records of outcomes of direct negotiations or arbitration Records of decisions of Native Courts Records of decisions of Civil Courts Records of conflicts and grievances between parties involved 	Adoption from MC&I (Natural Forest)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Records of conflicts and grievances between parties involved concerning their legal and customary rights within the FPMU, if any Records of outcomes of direct negotiations or arbitration concerning their legal and customary rights within the FPMU, if any Records of decisions of Native Courts concerning their legal and customary rights within the FPMU, if any Records of decisions of Civil Courts concerning their legal and customary rights within the FPMU, if any 	Sarawak Timber Association
P3	C3.2	I3.2.1	Peninsular Malaysia	Amend	<i>Forest Plantation Management Plan to Preventive and mitigation measures incorporated into Forest Plantation Management Plan</i>	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Preventive and mitigation measures incorporated into Forest Plantation Management Plan</i> 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P3	C3.2	I3.2.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sarawak	Add	<i>List of species/resources used by indigenous people and a management plan of these resources to be included in the Forest Plantation Management Plan for Peninsular Malaysia and Sarawak</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>List of species/resources used by indigenous people and a management plan of these resources to be included in the Forest Plantation Management Plan</i> 	WCS-Malaysia Program

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P3	C3.3	I3.3.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Delete	<i>Forest Plantation Management Plan</i>	This Verifier is not related with Indicator 3.3.1		Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P3	C3.3	I3.3.1	Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>if any</i> to the end of the sentence	Adoption from MC&I (Natural Forest)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Procedures for identifying and protecting sites of special cultural, ecological, economic or religious significance to indigenous peoples and provisions for rights of access to these sites List and maps depicting locations of important cultural, ecological, economic or religious sites in the forest plantation area to be certified/Forest Plantation Management Plan Records of dialogue and consultation with local communities and other relevant stakeholders, if any 	Sarawak Timber Association
P3	C3.3	I3.3.2	Peninsular Malaysia	Amend	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Dialogue and consultation</i> <i>Arbitration</i> <i>Civil Courts</i> to <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Records of dialogue and consultation held with aborigines and relevant stakeholders, if any</i> <i>Records of arbitration</i> <i>Decisions by Civil Court</i> 	Enhance Verifier with proposed wording	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Records of dialogue and consultation held with aborigines and relevant stakeholders, if any Records of arbitration Decisions by Civil Court 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P3	C3.3	I3.3.2	Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Dialogue and consultation</i> <i>Arbitration</i> <i>Native Courts</i> <i>Civil Courts</i> To <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Records of dialogue and consultation held with natives and relevant stakeholders, if any Records of arbitration Decisions of Native Courts and Civil Courts 	Adoption from MC&I (Natural Forest)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Records of dialogue and consultation held with natives and relevant stakeholders, if any Records of arbitration Decisions of Native Courts and Civil Courts 	Sarawak Timber Association

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P3	C3.4			Add	<i>plantation</i>	Added word for sentence clarity	Indigenous peoples shall be compensated for the application of their knowledge regarding the use of forest species or management systems in forest plantation operations. This compensation shall be formally agreed upon with their fee, and informed consent before forest operations commence.	Sarawak Timber Association
P3	C3.4	I3.4.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>if any</i>	Adoption from MC&I (Natural Forest)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Records of any traditional forest-related knowledge and practices of indigenous people used in forest plantation operations, if any Records of consultation with indigenous peoples, if any 	Sarawak Timber Association
P3	C3.4	I3.4.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<i>Documentation of appropriate mechanisms for consultation and compensation for the commercial utilization of traditional forest-related knowledge and practices of indigenous peoples to Mechanisms established and records for the commercial utilization of traditional forest-related knowledge and practices of aborigines, if any.</i>	Enhance Verifier with proposed wording	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Mechanisms established and records for the commercial utilization of traditional forest-related knowledge and practices of aborigines, if any.</i> 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P3	C3.4	I3.4.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>if any</i>	Adoption from MC&I (Natural Forest)	Documentation of appropriate mechanisms for consultation and compensation for the commercial utilisation of traditional forest-related knowledge and practices of indigenous people, if any	Sarawak Timber Association

Principle 4

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P4				General		The assumption that workers must predominantly derived from local communities is no longer valid or at best tenuous. The legal frameworks, laws, regulations etc. affecting local community and Workers are not synonymous, related or relevant. It would be reasonable to split the Principle into two parts: Community Relations under Principle 3 (Indigenous People's Rights) and Principle 4 dedicated to Workers Rights only. Collectively these principles consider and incorporate relevant parameters for management of the overall landscape to provide the context and foundations for the "Plantation Forest Management Plan".		Zedtee Sdn Bhd
P4				General		P4 "Indigenous Peoples Rights" as ascertained by the EIA would be relevant for the Management of "Community Relations?"		Zedtee Sdn Bhd
P4	C4.1			Add	<i>also opportunity to develop eco-tourism.</i>		The communities within, or adjacent to, the forest management area shall be given opportunities for employment, training, and other services also opportunity to develop eco-tourism.	MNS Penang Branch
P4	C4.1			Add	<i>... plantation ... unit</i>	Forest management areas replaced by Forest plantation management unit as stipulated in the key definitions of important terms used in the MC&I (Forest Plantations)(page 35 of the standard)	The communities within, or adjacent to, the forest plantation management unit shall be given opportunities for employment, training, and other services.	Sarawak Timber Association
P4	C4.1			Delete	<i>area</i>	Forest management areas replaced by Forest plantation management unit as stipulated in the key definitions of important terms used in the MC&I (Forest Plantations)(page 35 of the standard)	The communities within, or adjacent to, the forest plantation management unit shall be given opportunities for employment, training, and other services.	Sarawak Timber Association
P4	C4.1	I4.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia	Add	<i>records of financial gain by the locals (household)</i>	The financial gained by local communities as a point for verifier	Record of financial gain by the locals (household)	PERHILITAN

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P4	C4.1	I4.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sarawak	Delete	<i>Forest Plantation Management Plan</i>	Not related with Indicator 4.1.1		Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P4	C4.1	I4.1.1	Sarawak	Add	<i>if any</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Records of training, retraining, local infrastructure, facilities and social programs provided, if any 	Sarawak Timber Association
P4	C4.1	I4.1.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Record of workers from outside the local community and foreign workers</i> 	To ensure effective verification	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Record of workers from outside the local community and foreign workers</i> 	MTUC Sarawak Division
P4	C4.1	I4.1.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Delete	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Documentation of management commitment</i> <i>Records of efforts to recruit workers from local communities</i> 	Not related with Indicator 4.1.2		Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P4	C4.2			Add	<i>plantation</i>	To add in "plantation" as it is the standard for Forest Plantation	Forest plantation management shall meet or exceed all applicable laws and/or regulations covering health and safety of employees and their families.	Sarawak Timber Association
P4	C4.2	I4.2.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>EPF</i> 	EPF not included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> EPF 	MTUC Sarawak Division
P4	C4.2	I4.2.2		Add	<i>with current legislation and/or regulations</i>	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Availability of management policies addressing the occupational safety and health of forest workers and their families in accordance with current legislation and/or regulations.	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P4	C4.2	I4.2.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Establishment of Safety and Health Committees in accordance with Occupational Safety and Health Act, 1994 – Sections 30 and 31</i> <i>Employment of Safety and Health Officer in accordance with Occupational Safety and Health Act, 1994 – Section 29</i> 	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Establishment of Safety and Health Committees in accordance with Occupational Safety and Health Act, 1994 – Sections 30 and 31 Employment of Safety and Health Officer in accordance with Occupational Safety and Health Act, 1994 – Section 29 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P4	C4.2	I4.2.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Delete	<i>Management policy on safety and health of forest plantation workers and their families</i>	Adoption of Verifier from MC&I (Natural Forest)		Sarawak Timber Association

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P4	C4.2	I4.2.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Statement of policy on occupational safety and health in accordance with Occupational Safety and Health Act, 1994 - Section 16 Establishment of Safety and Health Committees in accordance with Occupational Safety and Health Act, 1994 - Sections 30 and 31 Employment of Safety and Health Officer in accordance with Occupational Safety and Health Act, 1994 - Section 29 	Adoption of Verifier from MC&I (Natural Forest)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Statement of policy on occupational safety and health in accordance with Occupational Safety and Health Act, 1994 - Section 16 Establishment of Safety and Health Committees in accordance with Occupational Safety and Health Act, 1994 - Sections 30 and 31 Employment of Safety and Health Officer in accordance with Occupational Safety and Health Act, 1994 - Section 29 	Sarawak Timber Association
P4	C4.2	I4.2.3	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	Minutes of Safety and Health Committee meetings	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Minutes of Safety and Health Committee meetings	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P4	C4.2	I4.2.4	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Delete	Minutes of joint employer-employee meetings	This Verifier does not apply to FDPM		Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P4	C4.2	I4.2.4	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	if any		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Minutes of Safety and Health Committee meetings Minutes of joint employer-employee meetings, if any Safety and health records of forest plantation workers and summary of records 	Sarawak Timber Association
P4	C4.2	I4.2.5	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<u>Federal Laws</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Environmental Quality (Scheduled Wastes) Regulations, 1989 	To change the year from 1989 to 2005. The regulation has been updated (REPEALED BY PU(A) 294/2005)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Environmental Quality (Scheduled Wastes) Regulations, 2005 	KTS Forests Management
P4	C4.3			General		MTCC to check and verify as Malaysia has not ratified Conventions 87 and 111 and thus are not applicable to the industry.		Sarawak Timber Association
P4	C4.3	I4.3.1		General		MTCC to check and verify as Malaysia has not ratified Conventions 87 and 111 and thus are not applicable to the industry.		Sarawak Timber Association
P4	C4.3	I4.3.1	Peninsular Malaysia	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record of number of unions and their members 	To ensure effective verification	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record of number of unions and their members 	MTUC Sarawak Division

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P4	C4.3	I4.3.1	Sabah	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record of number of unions and their members 	To ensure effective verification	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record of number of unions and their members 	MTUC Sarawak Division
P4	C4.3	I4.3.1	Sarawak	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record of number of unions and their members 	To ensure effective verification	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record of number of unions and their members 	MTUC Sarawak Division
P4	C4.3	I4.3.2		General		MTCC to check and verify as Malaysia has not ratified Conventions 87 and 111 and thus are not applicable to the industry.		Sarawak Timber Association
P4	C4.3	I4.3.2	Peninsular Malaysia	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record of number of workers covered by Collective Agreement 	Self-Explanatory	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record of number of workers covered by Collective Agreement 	MTUC Sarawak Division
P4	C4.3	I4.3.2	Sabah	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record of number of workers covered by Collective Agreement 	Self-Explanatory	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record of number of workers covered by Collective Agreement 	MTUC Sarawak Division
P4	C4.3	I4.3.2	Sarawak	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record of number of workers covered by Collective Agreement 	Self-Explanatory	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Record of number of workers covered by Collective Agreement 	MTUC Sarawak Division
P4	C4.3	I4.3.3	Peninsular Malaysia	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> National Labour Advisory Council (NLAC) 	NLAC not included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> National Labour Advisory Council (NLAC) 	MTUC Sarawak Division
P4	C4.3	I4.3.3	Peninsular Malaysia	Amend	Minutes of joint employer-employee meetings to National Joint Council and Departmental Joint Council	This Verifier does not apply to FDPM	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> National Joint Council and Departmental Joint Council 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P4	C4.3	I4.3.3	Sabah	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> National Labour Advisory Council (NLAC) 	NLAC not included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> National Labour Advisory Council (NLAC) 	MTUC Sarawak Division
P4	C4.3	I4.3.3	Sarawak	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> National Labour Advisory Council (NLAC) 	NLAC not included	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> National Labour Advisory Council (NLAC) 	MTUC Sarawak Division
P4	C4.3	I4.3.3	Sarawak	Delete	Minutes of joint employer-employee meetings	Redundant because it is the same as "record of fora for participation to resolve grievances"	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Procedures to address grievances and for conflict resolution in accordance with the requirements of the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Code of Conduct for Industrial Harmony, 1975 Industrial Relations Act, 1967 Labour Ordinance (Sarawak) Cap. 76 Records of fora for participation to resolve grievances 	Sarawak Timber Association

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P4	C4.4	I4.4.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) report</i> • <i>Social baseline studies/impact assessment</i> to <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Minutes of meetings of the District Action/Development Committee (Jawatankuasa Tindakan Daerah)</i> • <i>Report on social impact evaluation</i> 	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Minutes of meetings of the District Action/Development Committee (Jawatankuasa Tindakan Daerah) • Report on social impact evaluation 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P4	C4.4	I4.4.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>if applicable</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) report, if applicable • Records of meetings and/or consultations between forest plantation manager and affected local communities, if applicable 	Sarawak Timber Association
P4	C4.4	I4.4.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Delete	<i>Social baseline studies/impact assessment</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) report, if applicable • Records of meetings and/or consultations between forest plantation manager and affected local communities 	Sarawak Timber Association
P4	C4.5	I4.5.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Delete	<i>Human Rights Commission of Malaysia Act, 1999</i>	In line with MC&I(Natural Forests)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Records of outcomes of consultation and negotiation • Records of outcomes of arbitration • Records of decisions by Courts of Law 	Sarawak Timber Association

Principle 5

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P5				Add	<i>plantation</i>	For clarity	Forest plantation management operations shall encourage the efficient use of the forest's multiple products and services to ensure economic viability and a wide range of environmental and social benefits.	Sarawak Timber Association
P5				General		P5 "Benefits from the forests" consider the contribution of environmental services and forest multiple products for economic and social benefits. The "Workers' Rights" engaged with the production of these benefits may be more appropriately considered under this principle instead of community relation.		Zedtee Sdn Bhd
P5	C5.1			Add	<i>There shall be emphasis on species diversity through the cultivation of native species and minimise the setting up of monoculture forest plantations. after the current sentence</i>		Forest management shall strive toward economic viability, while taking into account the full environmental, social, and operational costs of production, and ensuring the investments necessary to maintain the ecological productivity of the forest. There shall be emphasis on species diversity through the cultivation of native species and minimise the setting up of monoculture forest plantations.	WCS-Malaysia Program
P5	C5.1			Add	<i>plantation</i>	As this is the standard for Forest Plantation	Forest plantation management shall strive toward economic viability, while taking into account the full environment, social, and operational costs of production, and ensuring the investments necessary to maintain the ecological productivity of the forest.	Sarawak Timber Association
P5	C5.1	I5.1.1		Amend	<i>Investments and reinvestments shall be made in forest plantation management, including for forest plantation administration, research, human resource development, environmental and social aspects to proposed wording</i>	Protection, economic and conservation aspect shall be integrated into this indicator.	Investments and reinvestments are made in forest plantation management, including for forest administration, research, human resource development, protection, economic, conservation, environmental and social aspects, consistent with the tenure of the forest plantation areas.	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P5	C5.1	I5.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Forest Plantation Management Plan</i> • <i>Annual operating and development budget, and expenditure</i> • <i>Annual Work Plan</i> with proposed wording.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 5-Year Development Plan Budget • Annual operating and development budget including from federal and other sources 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P5	C5.1	I5.1.1	Sarawak	Add	<i>Annual Harvesting Plan</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Forest Plantation Management Plan • Annual operating and development budget, and expenditure • Annual Work Plan/Annual Harvesting Plan 	Sarawak Timber Association
P5	C5.1	I5.1.2		Amend	<i>through species diversity</i> at the end of the current indicator.		Provisions and management are made to maintain, restore or enhance the productive capacity and ecological functions of the forest plantation areas to ensure its economic viability through species diversity.	WCS-Malaysia Program
P5	C5.1	I5.1.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<i>to include specific plans for species diversity and provision of ecosystem services</i>		Forest Plantation Management Plan to include specific plans for species diversity and provision of ecosystem services	WCS-Malaysia Program
P5	C5.1	I5.1.2	Sarawak	Add	<i>Annual Harvesting Plan</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Forest Plantation Management Plan • Annual Work Plan /Annual Harvesting Plan • Records of permanent sample plots and data analyses • Records of planting, including non-timber forest resources 	Sarawak Timber Association
P5	C5.2			Add	<i>Plantation</i>	This is the standard for Forest Plantation	Forest plantation management and marketing operations shall encourage the optimal use and local processing of the forest's diversity of products.	Sarawak Timber Association
P5	C5.3			Add	<i>and wastage</i> to the end of the current sentence.		Forest management shall minimize waste associated with harvesting and on-site processing operations and avoid damage to other forest resources and wastage.	WCS-Malaysia Program
P5	C5.3			Add	<i>Plantation</i>	This is the standard for Forest Plantation	Forest plantation management shall minimize waste associated with harvesting and on-site processing operations and avoid damage to other forest resources.	Sarawak Timber Association

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P5	C5.4			Add	<i>Plantation</i>	This is the standard for Forest Plantation	Forest plantation management shall strive to strengthen and diversify the local dependence on a single forest product.	Sarawak Timber Association
P5	C5.5			Amend	<i>shall to must</i>		Forest management operations must recognize, maintain, and, where appropriate, enhance the value of forest services and resources such as watersheds and fisheries.	MNS Penang Branch
P5	C5.5			Add	<i>Plantation</i>	This is the standard for Forest Plantation	Forest plantation management operations shall recognize, maintain, and, where appropriate, enhance the value of forest services and resources such as watersheds and fisheries.	Sarawak Timber Association
P5	C5.5	I5.5.1		Add	<i>full ... and all riparian zone as per JPS guidelines at all times.</i>		Availability and full implementation of guidelines and/or procedures to identify and demarcate sensitive areas for the protection of soil and water, watercourses and wetlands in forest plantation areas, and all Riparian Zone as per JPS Guidelines at all times.	MNS Penang Branch
P5	C5.5	I5.5.1	Peninsular Malaysia	Amend	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Procedures to identify and demarcate sensitive areas for the protection of soil and water, watercourses and wetlands</i> <i>Sensitive areas in the forest plantation identified, classified and mapped to</i> <i>Forest Plantation Management Plan</i> <i>Forest Harvesting Plan</i> 	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Forest Plantation Management Plan Forest Harvesting Plan 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P5	C5.5	I5.5.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>and protected to the end of the second verifier for each region.</i>		Sensitive areas in the forest plantation identified, classified and mapped and protected	WCS-Malaysia Program
P5	C5.5	I5.5.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Guidelines for Logging and Forest Clearing Activities</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Guidelines for Logging and Forest Clearing Activities 	WWF
P5	C5.5	I5.5.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Annual</i>	Sarawak only has Annual Harvesting Plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Forest Plantation Management Plan Annual Harvesting Plan 	Sarawak Timber Association

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P5	C5.5	I5.5.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Delete	<i>Annual Work Plan</i>	Sarawak only has Annual Harvesting Plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Forest Plantation Management Plan • Annual Harvesting Plan 	Sarawak Timber Association
P5	C5.6	I5.6.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Annual</i>	Sarawak only has Annual Harvesting Plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Forest Plantation Management Plan • Annual Harvesting Plan 	Sarawak Timber Association
P5	C5.6	I5.6.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Delete	<i>Area harvested according to the approved Annual Work Plan</i>	Sarawak only has Annual Harvesting Plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Forest Plantation Management Plan • Annual Harvesting Plan 	Sarawak Timber Association
P5	C5.6	I5.6.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Measures taken to sustain the provision of non-timber forest products</i>		Measures taken to sustain the provision of non-timber forest products	WCS-Malaysia Program
P5	C5.6	I5.6.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<i>Records of quantity of timber and non-timber forest products harvested to Records of timber and non- timber forest products and quantity harvested under licence in the forest plantation area, if any</i>	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Records of timber and non- timber forest products and quantity harvested under licence in the forest plantation area, if any 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P5	C5.6	I5.6.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>... from within the Forest Plantation Management Unit, if any</i>	For clarity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Records of quantity of timber and non-timber forest products harvested from within the Forest Plantation Management Unit, if any 	Sarawak Timber Association

Principle 6

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P6				Add	<i>Plantation</i>	For clarity	Forest plantation management shall conserve biological diversity and its associated values, water resources, soils and unique and fragile ecosystems and landscapes, and, by doing, maintain the ecological functions and the integrity of the forest.	Sarawak Timber Association
P6				General		This principle should be referred to in concurrent with Principle 9		WWF
P6				General	Where the forest plantation is located adjacent to an Environmentally Sensitive Area (ESA) of HCVA, adequate buffer zone shall be established and maintained from the boundary of the forest plantation and Environmentally Sensitive Areas/HCVA.	New criterion is added for establishment of buffer zones from the boundary of the forest plantations and Environmentally Sensitive Areas (ESAs)/HCVA. This criterion is extremely important to ensure adverse impacts from forest plantations such as spread of exotic species and diseases from forest plantations to these ESAs/HCVAs is limited. By ensuring an adequate buffer zone is established, the access into ESAs such as Protected Areas can be limited to a certain extent and this is one of the important measures to control poaching.		WWF
P6				General		P6 "Forest Management Plan" founded on EIA plan and implement action to achieve goal to meet community relation and benefits from forests expectations. Plantation Development is an extension of the FMP.		Zedtee Sdn Bhd
P6	C6.1			Amend	<i>shall to must</i>		Assessment of environmental impacts shall be completed – appropriate to the scale, intensity of forest management and the uniqueness of the affected resources – and adequately integrated into management systems. Assessments shall include landscape level consideration as well as the impacts of on-site processing facilities. Environmental impacts must be assessed prior to commencement of site-disturbing operations.	MNS Penang Branch

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P6	C6.1			Amend	<i>"Assessment of environmental impacts" to "Environmental impact assessment"; "site-disturbing" to "forest plantation"</i>		Environmental impacts assessment shall be completed – appropriate to the scale, intensity of forest plantation management and the uniqueness of the affected resources – and adequately integrated into management systems. Assessments shall include landscape level consideration as well as the impacts of on-site processing facilities. Environmental impacts shall be assessed prior to commencement of forest plantation operations.	Sarawak Timber Association
P6	C6.1			Add	<i>Plantation</i>		Environmental impacts assessment shall be completed – appropriate to the scale, intensity of forest plantation management and the uniqueness of the affected resources – and adequately integrated into management systems. Assessments shall include landscape level consideration as well as the impacts of on-site processing facilities. Environmental impacts shall be assessed prior to commencement of forest plantation operations.	Sarawak Timber Association
P6	C6.1	I6.1.1		Amend	<i>Assessment of environmental impacts ... to Environmental Impact Assessments ...</i>	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Environmental Impact Assessments are carried out, including landscape level considerations, as well as the impacts of on-site processing facilities, appropriate to the scale and intensity of forest plantation management, prior to commencement of site-disturbing operations in forest plantation areas.	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P6	C6.1	I6.1.1		Amend	<i>"Assessment of environmental impacts" change to "Environmental impact assessment"; "site-disturbing" to "forest plantation"</i>		Environmental impact assessments are carried out, including landscape level considerations, as well as the impacts of on-site processing facilities, appropriate to the scale and intensity of forest plantation management, prior to commencement in forest plantation areas.	Sarawak Timber Association

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P6	C6.1	I6.1.1		Add	<i>plantation</i>		Environmental impact assessments are carried out, including landscape level considerations, as well as the impacts of on-site processing facilities, appropriate to the scale and intensity of forest plantation management, prior to commencement in forest plantation areas.	Sarawak Timber Association
P6	C6.1	I6.1.1	Sabah	Add	Agreement of Environmental Conditions (AEC), Environment Protection (Prescribed Activities)(Environmental Impact Assessment) Order, 2012		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Agreement of Environmental Conditions (AEC), • Environment Protection (Prescribed Activities) (Environmental Impact Assessment) Order, 2012 	WWF
P6	C6.1	I6.1.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Environmental Management Plan (EMP)/Wildlife Management Plan (WMP)/Flora Management Plan (FMP) to be prerequisites in the EIA report to the Peninsular Malaysia region, with EMP, WMP, FMP for Sabah and Sarawak</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Environmental Management Plan (EMP)/Wildlife Management Plan (WMP)/Flora Management Plan (FMP) to be prerequisites in the EIA report to the Peninsular Malaysia region, with EMP, WMP, FMP for Sabah and Sarawak 	WCS-Malaysia Program
P6	C6.1	I6.1.2		Amend	<i>Assessment of environmental impacts ... to Environmental Impact Assessments ...</i>	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Environmental Impact Assessments are carried out, including the potential impacts on endangered, rare and threatened species of flora and fauna, and the need for biological corridors in forest plantation areas, appropriate to the scale and intensity of forest plantation management.	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P6	C6.1	I6.1.2		Amend	<i>"Assessment of environmental impacts" change to "Environmental impact assessment"</i>		Environmental impact assessment are carried out, including the potential impacts on endangered, rare and threatened species of flora and fauna, and the need for biological corridors in forest plantation areas, appropriate to the scale and intensity of forest plantation management.	Sarawak Timber Association
P6	C6.1	I6.1.2	Sarawak	Add	<i>Wild life Protection Ordinance, 1998 (Cap. 26)</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Natural Resources and Environment Ordinance, 1993 (Cap. 84) • Natural Resources and Environment (Prescribed Activities) Order 1994 • Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) report • Wild Life Protection Ordinance, 1998 (Cap. 26) 	Sarawak Timber Association

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P6	C6.1	I6.1.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	IUCN Red List/Wildlife Conservation Act, IUCN Red List/Malaysian Plants Red List (Peninsular), Wildlife Conservation Enactment (Sabah), Wild Life Protection Ordinance 1998 (Sarawak) Include: Managing Biodiversity in the Riparian Zone		<u>Peninsular Malaysia</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> IUCN Red List/Wildlife Conservation Act IUCN Red List/Malaysian Plants Red List <u>Sabah</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Wildlife Conservation Enactment <u>Sarawak</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Wild Life Protection Ordinance 1998 	WWF
P6	C6.1	I6.1.3	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<i>Forest Plantation Management Plan to Forest Plantation Management Plan with mitigation measures for all impacts identified in the environmental impact assessment.</i>	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Forest Plantation Management Plan with mitigation measures for all impacts identified in the environmental impact assessment.	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P6	C6.1	I6.1.3	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Plantation Development Plan 	WWF
P6	C6.2			Delete	<i>Inappropriate</i> from third sentence		Safeguards shall exist which protect rare, threatened and endangered species and their habitats (e.g. nesting and feeding areas). Conservation zones and protection areas shall be established, appropriate to the scale and intensity of forest management and the uniqueness of the affected resources. Hunting, fishing, trapping and collecting shall be controlled.	WCS-Malaysia Program
P6	C6.2			Amend	<i>controlled to prohibited</i>		Safeguards shall exist which protect rare, threatened and endangered species and their habitats (e.g. nesting and feeding areas). Conservation zones and protection areas shall be established, appropriate to the scale and intensity of forest management and the uniqueness of the affected resources. Hunting, fishing, trapping and collecting shall be prohibited.	WCS-Malaysia Program

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P6	C6.2			Amend	<i>shall to must</i>		Safeguards must exist which protect rare, threatened and endangered species and their habitats (e.g. nesting and feeding areas). Conservation zones and protection areas must be established, appropriate to the scale and intensity of forest management and the uniqueness of the affected resources. Inappropriate hunting, fishing, trapping and collecting shall be controlled.	MNS Penang Branch
P6	C6.2			Add	<i>plantation</i>	As this is the standard for Forest Plantation	Safeguards shall exist which protect rare, threatened and endangered species and their habitats (e.g. nesting and feeding areas). Conservation zones and protection areas shall be established, appropriate to the scale and intensity of forest plantation management and the uniqueness of the affected resources. Inappropriate hunting, fishing, trapping and collecting shall be controlled.	Sarawak Timber Association
P6	C6.2			Add	<i>salt licks as an example</i>		Safeguards shall exist which protect rare, threatened and endangered species and their habitats (e.g. nesting, salt lick and feeding areas). Conservation zones and protection areas shall be established, appropriate to the scale and intensity of forest management and the uniqueness of the affected resources. Illegal hunting, fishing, trapping and collecting shall be prohibited and prevented.	WWF
P6	C6.2	I6.2.1		Add	<i>Prey species of rare, threatened, endangered predators to be identified and protected. Implementation of measures to prevent and address human-wildlife conflict</i>		Availability and implementation of guidelines to identify and protect endangered, rare and threatened species of forest flora and fauna, including features of special biological interest, such as seed trees, nesting and feeding areas, in forest plantation areas. Prey species of rare, threatened, endangered predators to be identified and protected. Implementation of measures to prevent and address human-wildlife conflict	WCS-Malaysia Program

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P6	C6.2	I6.2.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Guidelines and measures to address human-wildlife conflict and Environmental Management Plan (EMP)/ Wildlife Management Plan (WMP) / Flora Management Plan (FMP) to be prerequisites in the EIA Report</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Guidelines and measures to address human-wildlife conflict Environmental Management Plan (EMP)/ Wildlife Management Plan (WMP) / Flora Management Plan (FMP) to be prerequisites in the EIA Report 	WCS-Malaysia Program
P6	C6.2	I6.2.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Guidelines for the identification and protection of rare, threatened and endangered species</i> <i>Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Report</i> to <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Director-General of Forestry's Circulars</i> <i>Minimum cutting limit for Neobalanocarpus heimii (Chengal) be equalled to or greater than 60 cm DBH</i> <i>Wildlife Conservation Act, 2010</i> <i>Records on protection of endangered, rare and threatened forest flora and fauna species, if present</i> <i>National Tiger Conservation Action Plan, 2008-2020</i> 	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Director-General of Forestry's Circulars Minimum cutting limit for <i>Neobalanocarpus heimii</i> (Chengal) be equalled to or greater than 60 cm DBH Wildlife Conservation Act, 2010 Records on protection of endangered, rare and threatened forest flora and fauna species, if present National Tiger Conservation Action Plan, 2008-2020 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P6	C6.2	I6.2.1		Add	seed/fruit/fig ... where official national/local guidelines are lacking, international guidelines is followed and experts should be referred to.	The IUCN Red List or Malaysian Red List can be referred to in order to identify which species are rare/endangered/threatened	Availability and implementation of guidelines to identify and protect endangered, rare and threatened species of forest flora and fauna, including features of special biological interest, such as seed/fruit/fig trees, nesting and feeding areas, in forest plantation areas where official national/local guidelines are lacking, international guidelines is followed and experts should be referred to.	WWF
P6	C6.2	I6.2.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	Clear on the ground demarcation of the conservation area		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Clear on the ground demarcation of the conservation 	WWF
P6	C6.2	I6.2.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Environmental Management Plan (EMP)/ Wildlife Management Plan (WMP) / Flora Management Plan (FMP) to be prerequisites in the EIA Report</i>		Environmental Management Plan (EMP)/ Wildlife Management Plan (WMP) / Flora Management Plan (FMP) to be prerequisites in the EIA Report	WCS-Malaysia Program

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P6	C6.2	I6.2.2		Amend	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Guidelines for the establishment of representative conservation and protection areas Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Report to Buffer strips for permanent streams and rivers in Inland Forest and Peat Swamp Forest of at least 5 m in width on either side of the stream or river, are marked and felling of trees is prohibited. Panduan Penubuhan dan Penyelenggaraan kawasan-kawasan Simpanan Hutan Dara, 1987 Virgin Jungle Reserves Seed Production Areas Wildlife Conservation Act, 2010 List of protected species (First Schedule) List of totally protected species (Second Schedule) List of fruit trees prohibited for felling 	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Buffer strips for permanent streams and rivers in Inland Forest and Peat Swamp Forest of at least 5 m in width on either side of the stream or river are marked and felling of trees is prohibited. Panduan Penubuhan dan Penyelenggaraan kawasan-kawasan Simpanan Hutan Dara, 1987 Virgin Jungle Reserves Seed Production Areas Wildlife Conservation Act, 2010 List of protected species (First Schedule) List of totally protected species (Second Schedule) List of fruit trees prohibited for felling 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P6	C6.2	I6.2.2		Add	Clear on the ground demarcation of the conservation area	The guidelines should be listed out, at least a few examples.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Clear on the ground demarcation of the conservation areas 	WWF
P6	C6.2	I6.2.3	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	Plantation management to establish a fund for long term conservation projects		Plantation management to establish a fund for long term conservation projects	WCS-Malaysia Program
P6	C6.2	I6.2.3	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	List of collaborative projects to Collaborative projects, if any	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Collaborative projects, if any	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P6	C6.2	I6.2.3	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	if any	Adoption of Verifier from MC&I (Natural Forest)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Records of meetings or collaboration List of collaborative projects, if any 	Sarawak Timber Association
P6	C6.2	I6.2.4	Peninsular Malaysia	Delete	inappropriate hunting	Hunting is always regarded as illegal hunting when it is against the law	Illegal hunting	PERHILITAN
P6	C6.2	I6.2.4		Amend	controlled to prohibited		Hunting, fishing and collecting activities shall be prohibited and unauthorised and/or inappropriate activities prevented in forest plantation areas.	WCS-Malaysia Program

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P6	C6.2	I6.2.4	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<i>periodical to periodic</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Measures to prevent unauthorised and/or inappropriate hunting, fishing, trapping and collection, such as periodic patrolling of forest plantation areas, signage and regulation of access to planted areas. 	WCS-Malaysia Program
P6	C6.2	I6.2.4		Add	Illegal, ... (e.g. including using firearms, snares, traps, etc.), Efforts should be carried out to prevent encroachment or illegal activities in plantation areas, e.g. these efforts can include setting up guard points and patrolling around the plantation border.		Illegal hunting (e.g. including using firearms, snares, traps, etc.), fishing, collecting and other unauthorized activities should be prohibited within the plantation and also the surrounding forest reserves. Unauthorized persons should be denied access into the plantation area. Efforts should be carried out to prevent encroachment or illegal activities in plantation areas, e.g. these efforts can include setting up guard points and patrolling around the plantation border.	WWF
P6	C6.2	I6.2.5	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Measures to prevent hunting, catching, collecting of endangered, rare and threatened species</i>		Measures to prevent hunting, catching, collecting of endangered, rare and threatened species	WCS-Malaysia Program
P6	C6.3			General		20% of a forest plantation shall be designated as such areas, or if forest plantation converted from degraded habitat shall be restored to its original forest habitat)	Ecological functions and values shall be maintained intact, enhanced, or restored, including:- a) Forest regeneration and succession. b) Genetic, species and ecosystem diversity. c) Natural cycles that affect the productivity of the forest ecosystem. (This Criterion shall apply only to areas/sites within the forest plantation management unit which are allocated for conservation or natural forest management*)	MNS Penang Branch

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P6	C6.3	I6.3.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<i>Guidelines for the conservation of generic, species and ecosystem diversity to</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>National Policy on Biological Diversity, 1998</i> • <i>Panduan Penubuhan dan Penyelenggaraan kawasan-kawasan Simpanan Hutan Dara, 1987</i> • <i>Manual Perhutanan, 2003 (Forestry Manual, 2003)</i> • <i>Minimum cutting limit for Neobalanocarpus heimii (Chengal) be equal or greater than 60 cm DBH</i> • <i>Seed Production Areas</i> 	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • National Policy on Biological Diversity, 1998 • Panduan Penubuhan dan Penyelenggaraan kawasan-kawasan Simpanan Hutan Dara, 1987 • Manual Perhutanan, 2003 (Forestry Manual, 2003) • Minimum cutting limit for <i>Neobalanocarpus heimii</i> (Chengal) be equal or greater than 60 cm DBH • Seed Production Areas 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P6	C6.3	I6.3.2		General		Specific guidelines should be listed out, at least a few as examples.		WWF
P6	C6.3	I6.3.3	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Managing Biodiversity in the Landscape • Managing Biodiversity in the Riparian Zone 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Managing Biodiversity in the Landscape • Managing Biodiversity in the Riparian Zone 	WWF
P6	C6.4			Amend	<i>shall to must</i>	Current trend is to “protect” hill slope, which is not representative of existing ecosystem, more lowland forest should be made representative. All river system should be protected and not included in any forest plantation.	Representative samples of existing ecosystems within the landscape must be protected in their natural state and recorded on maps, appropriate to the scale and intensity of operations and the uniqueness of the affected resources.	MNS Penang Branch
P6	C6.4	I6.4.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>and protection</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Records, maps and demarcation and protection of such areas 	WCS-Malaysia Program
P6	C6.5			Add	<i>plantation establishment</i>	To be in line with the verifier	Guidelines shall be prepared and implemented to: control erosion; minimize site damage during plantation establishment and harvesting, road construction, and all other mechanical disturbances; and protect water resources.	Sarawak Timber Association
P6	C6.5	I6.5.1		Delete	<i>Availability of forest plantation establishment procedures to avoid loss of top soil nutrients, and soil erosion and compaction from inappropriate use of mechanical and chemical techniques.</i>	Proposed to delete because it is similar with Indicator 6.5.2		Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P6	C6.5	I6.5.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Guidelines for Prevention and Control of Soil Erosion and Siltation in Malaysia</i>	These guidelines are provided by Department of Environment and adopted by most of the Project Proponent that undertake the EIA.	Guidelines for Prevention and Control of Soil Erosion and Siltation in Malaysia' inserted after the existing verifier.	Jabatan Alam Sekitar Sarawak

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P6	C6.5	I6.5.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<i>Standard operating procedures for harvesting operations to</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Guidelines for Reduced Impact Logging in Peninsular Malaysia, 2003 Garis Panduan Jalan Hutan, 2010 Forest Harvesting Plan 	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Guidelines for Reduced Impact Logging in Peninsular Malaysia, 2003 Garis Panduan Jalan Hutan, 2010 Forest Harvesting Plan 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P6	C6.5	I6.5.3	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Guidelines for forest road layout, construction and maintenance Harvesting Plan To <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Guidelines for Reduced Impact Logging in Peninsular Malaysia, 2003 Garis Panduan Jalan Hutan, 2010 	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Guidelines for Reduced Impact Logging in Peninsular Malaysia, 2003 Garis Panduan Jalan Hutan, 2010 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P6	C6.5	I6.5.4	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Guidelines for conservation of buffer strips along streams and rivers Forest Plantation Management Plan to <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Guidelines for Reduced impact Logging in Peninsular Malaysia, 2003 Garis Panduan Jalan Hutan, 2010 Forest Harvesting Plan 	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Guidelines for Reduced impact Logging in Peninsular Malaysia, 2003 Garis Panduan Jalan Hutan, 2010 Forest Harvesting Plan 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P6	C6.5	I6.5.4	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Guidelines for Prevention and Control of Soil Erosion and Siltation in Malaysia</i>	These guidelines provided by Department of Environment and adopted by the Proponent Many undertake the EIA for the prevention and control of river bank erosion (riverbank erosion) are also included in the guidelines.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Guidelines for Prevention and Control of Soil Erosion and Siltation in Malaysia 	Jabatan Alam Sekitar Sarawak
P6	C6.5	I6.5.4	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	DID Guidelines, Managing Biodiversity in the Landscape and Managing Biodiversity in the Riparian Zone		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> DID Guidelines Managing Biodiversity in the Landscape Managing Biodiversity in the Riparian Zone 	WWF
P6	C6.6	I6.6.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<u>Federal Laws</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Environmental Quality (Scheduled Wastes) Regulations, 1989 	To change the year from 1989 to 2005. The regulation has been updated (REPEALED BY PU(A) 294/2005)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Environmental Quality (Scheduled Wastes) Regulations, 2005 	KTS Forests Management
P6	C6.6	I6.6.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<i>Environmental Quality (Scheduled Wastes) Regulations 1989 to Regulations of the Environmental Quality (Scheduled Wastes) Regulations 2005</i>	The rule have been cancelled and replaced with a new rule.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Regulations of the Environmental Quality (Scheduled Wastes) Regulations 2005 	Jabatan Alam Sekitar Sarawak

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P6	C6.6	I6.6.1		Add	monitoring measures must be in place to ensure that pesticides used are not polluting the water bodies		Availability and implementation of guidelines and/or procedures on the use of chemicals in forest plantation areas approved by relevant regulatory authorities. Monitoring measures must be in place to ensure that pesticides used are not polluting the water bodies.	WWF
P6	C6.6	I6.6.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>SOP for chemical usage</i>	Adoption of Verifier from MC&I (Natural Forest)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Training records • SOP for chemical usage 	Sarawak Timber Association
P6	C6.7	I6.7.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Good storage of scheduled wastes.</i>	Good storage of scheduled wastes is important in the management of the wastes.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Good storage of scheduled wastes 	Jabatan Alam Sekitar Sarawak
P6	C6.8	I6.8.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Delete	<i>Cartagena Protocol on Biosafety to the Convention on Biological Diversity, 2000</i>	Not related with Indicator 6.8.1		Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P6	C6.8	I6.8.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Delete	<i>Cartagena Protocol on Biosafety to the Convention on Biological Diversity, 2000</i>	Adoption of Verifier from MC&I (Natural Forest)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Documentation and monitoring records of use of biological control agents, if applied 	Sarawak Timber Association
P6	C6.9	I6.9.1		Delete	<i>Forest Plantation Managers shall carefully</i>		Document, control and monitor on the use of exotic species to avoid adverse ecological impacts.	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P6	C6.10			Add	a) ... and forest categories set out in S 10 (1) (b), (d), (e), (f), (g), (h), (i), (j) of the Forestry Act 1984; b) does not occur in ecological corridors and environmentally sensitive areas c) does not exceed 5% of the total area of permanent reserved forest d) does not affect the viability of the area to revert to natural forest cover in the long term, upon the expiry of the plantation lease period and e) will enable clear, substantial, additional, secure, long- term benefits across the forest management unit.		a) does not occur on high conservation value forest areas, and forest categories set out in S 10 (1) (b), (d), (e), (f), (g), (h), (i), (j) of the Forestry Act 1984; b) does not occur in ecological corridors and environmentally sensitive areas c) does not exceed 5% of the total area of permanent reserved forest d) does not affect the viability of the area to revert to natural forest cover in the long term, upon the expiry of the plantation lease period and e) will enable clear, substantial, additional, secure, long- term benefits across the forest management unit.	WCS-Malaysia Program

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P6	C6.10			Amend	<i>shall to must</i>	It is preferable to use abandon agricultural land and the like for conversion to forest plantations.	Forest conversion to plantations or non-forest land uses must not occur	MNS Penang Branch
P6	C6.10			Add	<i>except already degraded habitat, and classified as such before 1995</i>	It is preferable to use abandon agricultural land and the like for conversion to forest plantations.	Forest conversion to plantations or non-forest land uses must not occur, except in already degraded habitat, and classified as such before 1995.	MNS Penang Branch
P6	C6.10			Add	The National Physical Plan 2 for Peninsular Malaysia	New indicator is added for the above criterion.		WWF
P6	C6.10			Add	a) Maps showing the forest plantation boundary, buffer zone and distance from ESA/HCV b) Clear on the ground demarcation of the forest plantation boundary and the buffer zone.	New Verifier for above criterion.	a) Maps showing the forest plantation boundary, buffer zone and distance from ESA/HCV b) Clear on the ground demarcation of the forest plantation boundary and the buffer zone.	WWF
P6	C6.10	I6.10.1		Add	<i>and forest categories set out in S 10 (1)(b), (d), (e), (f), (g), (h), (i), (j) of the Forestry Act 1984, does not occur in ecological corridors and environmentally sensitive areas, does not exceed 5% of the total area of PRF, does not affect the viability of the area to revert to natural forest cover in the long term ... and shall provide clear</i>		Conversion of forest area to forest plantations, consistent with the provisions of relevant federal and state legal frameworks and policies, does not occur on high conservation value forest areas and forest categories set out in S 10 (1)(b), (d), (e), (f), (g), (h), (i), (j) of the Forestry Act 1984, does not affect the viability of the area to revert to natural forest cover in the long term and shall provide clear, substantial, additional, secure and long term benefits across the forest plantation management unit. (This indicator shall be complied with by plantations established in areas converted from natural forests after 1 January 2010)	WCS-Malaysia Program
P6	C6.10	I6.10.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Protection of natural forests in ecological corridors of the Central Forest Spine and environmentally sensitive areas identified in the National Physical Plan, Wildlife Management Plan, Natural Flora Management Plan, Environmental Management Plan, Should also include all verifiers set out in 6.10 of MC&I (Natural Forest)</i>		Protection of natural forests in ecological corridors of the Central Forest Spine and environmentally sensitive areas identified in the National Physical Plan <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Wildlife Management Plan • Natural Flora Management Plan • Environmental Management Plan Should also include all verifiers set out in 6.10 of MC&I (Natural Forest)	WCS-Malaysia Program

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P6	C6.10	I6.10.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Director-General of Forestry's Circular</i>	New verifier	Director-General of Forestry's Circular.	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P6	C6.10	I6.10.1		Amend	<i>1 January 2020</i>	MTCC to check and verify, propose to change the date to 1 January 2020 as establishment of plantation in Sarawak is still on-going		Sarawak Timber Association
P6	C6.10	I6.10.1		General		WWF-Malaysia has reservations about this criterion as this criterion allows for conversion of natural forests to forest plantations		WWF
P6	C6.10	I6.10.2		Add	<i>... (a maximum of 5%)</i>		Conversion of forest plantation area to non-forest land uses, consistent with the provisions of relevant federal and state legal frameworks and policies, shall entail a very limited portion (a maximum of 5 %) of the forest plantation management unit, and provide higher economic values as compared to its original use, in the overall context of the need for socio-economic development of the country.	WCS-Malaysia Program
P6	C6.10	I6.10.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Protection of natural forests in ecological corridors of the Central Forest Spine and environmentally sensitive areas identified in the National Physical Plan • Wildlife Management Plan • Natural Flora Management Plan • Environmental Management Plan <p>Should also include all verifiers set out in 6.10 of MC&I (Natural Forest)</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Protection of natural forests in ecological corridors of the Central Forest Spine and environmentally sensitive areas identified in the National Physical Plan <p>Records of conversion of forest plantation area to non-forest land uses</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cost benefit analysis including social aspects • Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) report • Wildlife Management Plan • Natural Flora Management Plan • Environmental Management Plan <p>Should also include all verifiers set out in 6.10 of MC&I (Natural Forest)</p>	WCS-Malaysia Program
P6	C6.10	I6.10.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Director-General of Forestry's Circular</i>	New verifier	Director-General of Forestry's Circular.	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia

Principle 7

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text / amendment	Respondent Name
P7				General		P7 "Monitoring and assessment" of the results and performance of the forest management.		Zedtee Sdn Bhd
P7	C7.1			Add	<i>Identification of places where it provides critical ecosystem services</i>	Criterion should include identification of places where it provides critical ecosystem services	j) Identification of places where it provides critical ecosystem services	WWF
P7	C7.1	I7.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Wildlife Management Plan</i> • <i>Natural Flora Management Plan</i> • <i>Environmental Management Plan</i> 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Forest Plantation Management Plan • Wildlife Management Plan • Natural Flora Management Plan • Environmental Management Plan 	WCS-Malaysia Program
P7	C7.1	I7.1.1		Amend	<i>Implementation of forest plantation management plan covering items (a) to (i) in Criterion 7.1, and prepared in accordance with existing guidelines and the provisions listed in Principle 1 to Availability and implementation of Forest Plantation Management Plan.</i>	Existing indicator is not understandable.	Availability and implementation of Forest Plantation Management Plan.	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P7	C7.1	I7.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Environmental Management Plan</i>	Environmental Management Plan is made compulsory for every project EIA and submitted to DOE for approval.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Environmental Management Plan 	Jabatan Alam Sekitar Sarawak
P7	C7.3			Add	<i>plantation</i>	As this is the standard for Forest Plantation	Forest plantation workers shall receive adequate training and supervision to ensure proper implementation of the management plan.	Sarawak Timber Association
P7	C7.3	I7.3.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<i>Enhance Verifier 'List of training facilities and programmes conducted and/or attended to Training facilities and programmes of the Forestry Department Peninsular Malaysia</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Training facilities and programmes of the Forestry Department Peninsular Malaysia 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P7	C7.4			Add	<i>plantation</i>	As this is the standard for Forest Plantation	While respecting the confidentiality of information, forest plantation managers shall make publicly available a summary of the primary elements of management plan, including those listed in Criterion 7.1	Sarawak Timber Association
P7	C7.4	I7.4.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<i>Summary of the Forest Plantation Management Plan made publicly available to Public summary of the Forest Plantation Management Plan</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Public summary of the Forest Plantation Management Plan 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P7	C7.4	I7.4.1	Peninsular Malaysia/	Amend	<i>Public summary of the Forest Plantation Management Plan</i>	Adoption of Verifier from MC&I (Natural Forest)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Public summary of the Forest Plantation Management Plan 	Sarawak Timber

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text / amendment	Respondent Name
			Sabah/ Sarawak					Association

Principle 8

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text / amendment	Respondent Name
P8	C8.1			Add	<i>plantation</i>	As this is the standard for Forest Plantation	The frequency and intensity of monitoring shall be determined by the scale and intensity of forest plantation management operations as well as the relative complexity and fragility of the affected environment. Monitoring procedures shall be consistent and replicable over time to allow comparison of results and assessment of change.	Sarawak Timber Association
P8	C8.1	I8.1.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Environmental Management Plan</i>	Environmental monitoring program is one of the elements in the EMR and must be submitted to the Department of Environment for approval.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Environmental Management Plan 	Jabatan Alam Sekitar Sarawak
P8	C8.2			Add	<i>plantation</i>	As this is the standard for Forest Plantation	<p>Forest plantation management shall include the research and data collection needed to monitor, at a minimum, the following indicators:-</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yield of all forest products harvested Growth rates, regeneration and condition of the forest plantation Composition and observed changes in the flora and fauna Environmental and social impacts of harvesting and other operations Costs, productivity and efficiency of forest management 	Sarawak Timber Association
P8	C8.3	I8.3.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Delete	<i>Felling extraction and transportation records</i>	This Verifier is not related with Indicator 8.3.1		Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P8	C8.4	I8.4.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Revised Forest Plantation Management Plan</i> <i>Monitoring reports</i> to <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Relevant results of monitoring activities shall be incorporated into the revision of the Forest Plantation Management Plan</i> 	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Relevant results of monitoring activities shall be incorporated into the revision of the Forest Plantation Management Plan 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P8	C8.5			Add	<i>plantation</i>	As this is the standard for Forest Plantation	While respecting the confidentiality of information, forest plantation managers shall make available a summary of the results of monitoring indicators, including those listed in Criterion 8.2	Sarawak Timber Association

P8	C8.5	I8.5.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<i>Public summary of results of monitoring indicators</i>	Adoption of Verifier from MC&I (Natural Forest)	Public summary of results of monitoring indicators	Sarawak Timber Association
----	------	--------	--	-------	---	--	---	----------------------------------

Principle 9

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text / amendment	Respondent Name
P9				General		<p>All the considerations under this principle had been addressed in the preceding principles particularly under Environmental Impact. For example:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Indicators 9.1.1/6.1.2 • Indicators 9.2.1/6.1.1/6.2.2 • Indicators 9.3.1/6.4.1/6.4.2 <p>It is superfluous and the review should strive to make the standard more even and "consumer friendly" by removing some of the repetitions and cross-references.</p>		Zedtee Sdn Bhd
P9	C9.1			Add	<i>plantation</i>	For clarity	Assessment to determine the presence of the attributes consistent with High Conservation Value Forests will be completed, appropriate to scale and intensity of forest plantation management.	Sarawak Timber Association
P9	C9.1	I9.1.1		Amend	<i>Forest plantation managers shall conduct an assessment to identify High Conservation Value Forests (HCVFs) in accordance with relevant guidelines, appropriate to scale and intensity of management for forest plantation areas, and in consultation with relevant stakeholders and experts to Forest plantation managers shall determine the presence of HCVF attributes in the forest plantation areas in accordance with relevant federal, state and local laws, appropriate to the level and intensity of forest management operations in the forest plantation areas, and in consultation with relevant stakeholders.</i>	At this stage, experts are not needed as stakeholder.	Forest plantation managers shall determine the presence of HCVF attributes in the forest plantation areas in accordance with relevant federal, state and local laws, appropriate to the level and intensity of forest management operations in the forest plantation areas, and in consultation with relevant stakeholders.	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P9	C9.1	I9.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Delete	<i>in the Forest Plantation Management Plan</i>	As it can be found in HCVF map	Report on the assessment, identification and demarcation on maps of HCVFs	Sarawak Timber Association

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text / amendment	Respondent Name
P9	C9.1	I9.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	High Conservation Value Forest (HCVF) Toolkit for Malaysia: A national guide for identifying, managing and monitoring High Conservation Value Forests	There is currently no other guidelines apart from the one WWF produced. WWF strongly recommend listing it here as reference.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> High Conservation Value Forest (HCVF) Toolkit for Malaysia: A national guide for identifying, managing and monitoring High Conservation Value Forests, WWF, 2009 	WWF
P9	C9.1	I9.1.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Report on the assessment, identification and demarcation on maps of HCVFs in the Forest Plantation Management Plan</i> to <i>Report on assessment, identification and demarcation on maps of HCVFs</i> <i>Record of consultations with relevant stakeholders</i> 	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Report on assessment, identification and demarcation on maps of HCVFs Record of consultations with relevant stakeholders 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P9	C9.2	I9.2.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<i>Records of meetings/dialogues with relevant stakeholders and experts regarding the HCVFs to Evidence of consultation/Records of the comments of the stakeholders</i>	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Evidence of consultation/Records of the comments of the stakeholders	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P9	C9.3	I9.3.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<i>HCVF areas are mapped and incorporated into the Forest Plantation Management Plan and demarcated on the ground to HCVF areas demarcated on maps in the Forest Plantation Management Plan</i>	Existing Verifier is not clear.	HCVF areas demarcated on maps in the Forest Plantation Management Plan	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P9	C9.3	I9.3.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	'demarcated' and replace with 'marked with signage'	More practical on the ground	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> HCVF areas are mapped and incorporated into the Forest Plantation Management Plan and on the ground Management prescriptions to maintain and/or enhance HCVF attributes, and reports on measures taken 	Sarawak Timber Association
P9	C9.4	I9.4.1		General		Need to check type and extent of assessment requires for "effectiveness of the measures" MTCC to check and verify		Sarawak Timber Association
P9	C9.4	I9.4.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Amend	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Revised Forest Plantation Management Plan</i> <i>Monitoring records</i> to <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Relevant results and findings of HCVF monitoring activities shall be incorporated into the revision of the Forest Plantation Management Plan</i> 	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Relevant results and findings of HCVF monitoring activities shall be incorporated into the revision of the Forest Plantation Management Plan 	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia

Principle 10

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P10				General		A Principle to distinguish the standard from the Natural Forest? All its elements would had been addressed by the preceding principles particularly P4-8. It could easily be a section of the FMP or in Sarawak context, a Schedule under the LPF license.		Zedtee Sdn Bhd
P10	C10.1	I10.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Implementation of action plans for natural forest conservation and restoration</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Forest Plantation Management Plan • Annual Work Plan • Implementation of action plans for natural forest conservation and restoration 	WCS-Malaysia Program
P10	C10.1	I10.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Annual Harvesting Plan</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Forest Plantation Management Plan • Annual Work Plan/Annual Harvesting Plan 	Sarawak Timber Association
P10	C10.1	I10.1.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Implementation can also be measured and verified through the monitoring plan and work report other than the documents listed.</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Implementation can also be measured and verified through the monitoring plan and work report other than the documents listed. 	WWF
P10	C10.2	I10.2.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Records, maps, demarcation and protection of natural forest areas</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Forest Plantation Management Plan • Records, maps, demarcation and protection of natural forest areas 	WCS-Malaysia Program
P10	C10.2	I10.2.1		Amend	<i>Forest plantation design and layout shall promote the protection, restoration and conservation of natural forests for forest plantation areas to Forest plantation design and layout shall promote the protection, restoration and conservation of natural forest.</i>	Use more coherent wordings.	Forest plantation design and layout shall promote the protection, restoration and conservation of natural forest.	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P10	C10.2	I10.2.1		Amend	<i>for to within</i>		Forest plantation design and layout shall promote the protection, restoration and conservation of natural forests within forest plantation areas.	Sarawak Timber Association
P10	C10.2	I10.2.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Documentation and maps depicting areas managed as natural forests in the forest plantation area</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Forest Plantation Management Plan • Documentation and maps depicting areas managed as natural forests in the forest plantation area 	Sarawak Timber Association

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P10	C10.2	I10.2.1		Add	<i>Clear on the ground demarcation of the areas for protection, restoration and conservation areas, wildlife corridors and buffer strip.</i>		Forest plantation design and layout shall promote protection, restoration and conservation of natural forests for forest plantation areas and clear on the ground demarcation of the areas for protection, restoration and conservation areas, wildlife corridors and buffer strip.	WWF
P10	C10.2	I10.2.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Records, maps, demarcation and protection of such areas</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Forest Plantation Management Plan • Records and maps of planting patterns in the forest plantation area • Records, maps, demarcation and protection of such areas 	WCS-Malaysia Program
P10	C10.2	I10.2.2		Add	<i>Clear on the ground demarcation of the areas for protection, restoration and conservation areas, wildlife corridors and buffer strip.</i>		Forest plantation establishment shall, appropriate to the scale of the operation, follow natural landscape and take into account the need for wildlife corridors, buffer strips for permanent streams and rivers, as well as a mosaic of stands of different age classes. Clear on the ground demarcation of the areas for protection, restoration and conservation areas, wildlife corridors and buffer strip.	WWF
P10	C10.3	I10.3.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Action taken to plant a diversity of species</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • List of species planted in the forest plantation area, including their origin • Action taken to plant a diversity of species 	WCS-Malaysia Program

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P10	C10.4			Add	<i>Exotic species which are invasive shall not be introduced and those already introduced shall be withdrawn.</i>		The selection of species for planting shall be based on their overall suitability for the site and their appropriateness to the management objectives. In order to enhance the conservation of biological diversity, native species are preferred over exotic species, other than the already established and proven exotic species, in the establishment of plantations and the restoration of degraded ecosystems. Exotic species, which shall be used only when their performance is greater than that of native species, shall be carefully monitored to detect unusual mortality, disease, or insect outbreaks and adverse ecological impacts. Exotic species which are invasive shall not be introduced and those already introduced shall be withdrawn.	WCS-Malaysia Program
P10	C10.4	I10.4.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Delete	Documentation of growth characteristics, performance and management of the selected species for forest plantation establishment		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Records of soil and site survey Records of permanent sample plots 	Sarawak Timber Association
P10	C10.4	I10.4.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Records of permanent sample plots</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Records of soil and site survey Records of permanent sample plots 	Sarawak Timber Association
P10	C10.4	I10.4.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>records of species trial, if any</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Results of comparative justification and/or analysis on the advantages/benefits of using exotic species over native species found naturally in the planted areas for forest plantations establishment and/or restoration Records of species trial, if any 	Sarawak Timber Association
P10	C10.4	I10.4.3	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>Action taken to control spread of invasive exotic species</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Records of monitoring of forest plantations established with exotic species Results of analysis of permanent sample plots Action taken to control spread of invasive exotic species 	WCS-Malaysia Program

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P10	C10.4	I10.4.3	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Delete	Records of monitoring of forest plantations established with exotic species	Redundant sentence		Sarawak Timber Association
P10	C10.4	I10.4.3	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	Results of analysis of permanent sample plots		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Results of analysis of permanent sample plots 	Sarawak Timber Association
P10	C10.5	I10.5.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<i>... and their demarcation and protection</i>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Documentation and maps depicting areas managed as natural forest in the forest plantation area, and their demarcation and protection Management strategy, plans and programs for monitoring progress in managing the natural forest 	WCS-Malaysia Program
P10	C10.5	I10.5.1		Delete	<i>Indicator 10.5.1</i>	Requirement in Indicator 10.5.1 is similar to Indicator 10.2.2. Propose to integrate with Indicator 10.2.2.		Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P10	C10.6	I10.6.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Delete	<i>Documentation of choice of species selected for forest plantation establishment</i>	Sentence was covered in 10.4.1 and 10.4.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Guidelines for site preparation and planting techniques Guidelines for forest road layout, construction and maintenance Harvesting Plan 	Sarawak Timber Association
P10	C10.7			Amend	<i>... Plantation management shall make every effort to move away from chemical pesticides and fertilizers, including their use in nurseries to ... Plantation management have to avoid or reduce the usage of chemical pesticides and fertilizer, including their use in nurseries.</i>	Use more coherent wordings.	<i>... Plantation management have to avoid or reduce the usage of chemical pesticides and fertilizer, including their use in nurseries.</i>	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P10	C10.8			Add	<i>... especially on adjacent area ...</i>	Add more coherent wording	Appropriate to the scale and diversity of the operations, monitoring of plantations shall include regular assessment of potential on-site and off-site ecological and social impacts especially on adjacent area, (e.g. natural regeneration, effects on water resources and soil fertility, and impacts on local welfare...	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P10	C10.8			Delete		This is covered under Principle 2		Sarawak Timber Association

Principle	Criteria	Indicator	Verifier	Amend/ Delete/ Add/ General	Proposal for Amendment/Deletion/Addition	Comment	Proposed text/Amendment	Respondent Name
P10	C10.8	I10.8.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Action taken to address adverse impacts 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Annual Work Plan Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) report Monitoring reports Action taken to address adverse impacts 	WCS-Malaysia Program
P10	C10.8	I10.8.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	... especially on adjacent area ...	Add more coherent wording	Availability and implementation of programs, appropriate to the scale and diversity of the forest plantation operations, to monitor the potential on-site and off-site ecological and social impacts especially on adjacent area of forest plantation establishment and development.	Jabatan Perhutanan Semenanjung Malaysia
P10	C10.8	I10.8.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Environmental Management Plan 	Environmental Management Plan is made compulsory for every EIA project and submitted to DOE for approval.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Environmental Management Plan 	Jabatan Alam Sekitar Sarawak
P10	C10.8	I10.8.1	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Annual Harvesting Plan 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Annual Work Plan/Annual Harvesting Plan Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) report Monitoring reports 	Sarawak Timber Association
P10	C10.8	I10.8.2	Peninsular Malaysia/ Sabah/ Sarawak	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Action taken to exclude, withdraw unsuitable exotic species 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reports on nursery and field trials, including provenance trials, of the selected species used in forest plantation establishment Results and analysis of nursery and field trials, including provenance trials, of the selected species used in forest plantation establishment Action taken to exclude, withdraw unsuitable exotic species. 	WCS-Malaysia Program
P10	C10.8	I10.8.3	Sabah	Add	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Land Acquisition Ordinance 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Land Acquisition Ordinance 	WWF