



JABATAN PERHUTANAN SEMENANJUNG MALAYSIA  
(KEMENTERIAN SUMBER ASLI DAN ALAM SEKITAR)  
JALAN SULTAN SALAHUDDIN  
50660 KUALA LUMPUR

Telefon : 603-26164488 Fax : 603-26925657 Homepage : <http://www.forestry.gov.my>



Ruj. Kami : JH(S) 197.28.4 SJ 2 ( 9 )  
Tarikh : 18 Mac 2013

**SEGERA DENGAN FAKS**

**Ketua Pegawai Eksekutif**  
Malaysian Timber Certification Council,  
C-08-05, Blok 5, Megan Avenue II,  
No.12, Jalan Yap Kwan Seng,  
50450 Kuala Lumpur  
(u.p.: Encik Yong Teng Koon)

Tuan,

**SEMAKAN SEMULA KRITERIA DAN PETUNJUK BAGI PENSIJILAN  
PENGURUSAN HUTAN DI MALAYSIA (LADANG HUTAN) [MC&I (LADANG  
HUTAN)] – KOMEN UMUM KALI PERTAMA**

Dengan segala hormatnya saya merujuk kepada perkara tersebut di atas.

2. Sukacita dikemukakan bersama-sama ini maklumbalas terhadap dokumen standard MC&I (Forest Plantation) untuk perhatian dan tindakan tuan selanjutnya.
3. Surat tuan (4) MTCC7/1/7 Vol.1 bertarikh 8 Januari 2013 mengenai perkara yang sama adalah berkaitan dan dirujuk.

Sekian, terima kasih.

**“BERKHIDMAT UNTUK NEGARA”  
“SAYANGI HUTAN”  
“JPSM BERWAWASAN”  
“1 MALAYSIA, RAKYAT DIDAHULUKAN, PENCAPAIAN DIUTAMAKAN”**

Saya yang menurut perintah,

(DATO' PROF. DR. ~~H.J. ABD. RAHMAN~~ BIN HJ. ABD. RAHIM)  
Ketua Pengarah Perhutanan  
Semenanjung Malaysia

s.k. YBhg. Dato' Prof. Dr. KPPSM  
YBhg. Dato' TKP(DP)  
YBhg. Dato' TKP(OT)

**FIRST PUBLIC COMMENT ON STANDARD MC&I (FOREST PLANTATION)**

<b>Principle / Criterion / Indicator / Verifier</b>	<b>Proposal for amendment / deletion / addition</b>	<b>Reasons for proposed amendment / deletion / addition</b>	<b>Proposed wording for amendment / addition</b>
Indicator 1.1.1	Drop Verifier 'Protection of Wildlife Act, 1972.'	Use the latest Act.	Replace Verifier with Wildlife Conservation Act, 2010.
Indicator 1.1.1	Additional Verifier.	Add new existing policy.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• National Physical Plan 2, 2010</li> <li>• National Timber Industry Policy, 2009-2020</li> </ul>
Indicator 1.1.2	Drop Indicator 'discussion with forest plantation managers and relevant stakeholders on the relevant federal and state laws, administrative requirements and the regulatory framework, as well as conducting field observations.'	The word 'discussion' does not indicate proofs. Therefore use 'record and outcome of interview' to show evidence.	Replace Indicator with 'Record and outcome of interview with Forest Plantation Manager on the applicable federal, state and local laws as well as the regulatory framework'.
Indicator 1.2.1	Drop Verifier: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• List of rent and fees payable, royalty structure and rates.</li> </ul>	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Replace with Verifier: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• National Forestry Act, 1984</li> <li>• State Forest Enactments</li> <li>• State Forest Rules – Second Schedule (premium rate), Third</li> </ul>

Principle / Criterion / Indicator / Verifier	Proposal for amendment / deletion / addition	Reasons for proposed amendment / deletion / addition	Proposed wording for amendment / addition
Indicator 1.5.2	Drop Verifier 'Records of monitoring and actions taken.'	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<p>Schedule (royalty rate), Fourth Schedule (forest premium and cess) and Fifth Schedule (liquidated damages)</p> <p>Replace with Verifier:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Evidence of control measures (e.g. signage, boundaries demarcation, etc)</li> <li>• Records of actions taken and copies of reports to relevant authorities</li> <li>• National Forestry Act, 1984 – Sections 15, 32, 47, 50, 81, 82 and 86</li> <li>• State Forest Enactments</li> </ul>
Indicator 1.6.1	Enhance Verifier 'Records or statements of such commitment' with proposed wording. Add Verifier.	The word 'Record' change to 'Written' for coherent.	Written policies or statements of such commitment through poster or banner.
Indicator 1.6.2	Add Verifier.	This matter have been implemented by SFD but never been mentioned.	Evidence of distribution of policy statement to stakeholders.

Principle / Criterion / Indicator / Verifier	Proposal for amendment / deletion / addition	Reasons for proposed amendment / deletion / addition	Proposed wording for amendment / addition
Indicator 2.1.1	Add Verifier.	This matter have been implemented by SFD but never been mentioned.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Records of gazettelement of Permanent Reserved Forest (PRF)</li> <li>• Entry permits</li> <li>• Road permits</li> <li>• Usage permits</li> </ul>
Indicator 2.2.2	Drop Verifier 'Records of collaboration.'	Enhance Verifier with clearer evidence.	<p>Replace with Verifier:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Records of such collaboration, including participation in the resolution of land claims, if any</li> <li>• Records of consultations held with the local communities / indigenous peoples to identify and document areas traditionally used and sites of significant importance to them, if any (e.g. cultural, religious sites, water intake point)</li> <li>• Records of actions taken to protect the identified sites of significant importance ,if any (e.g.</li> </ul>

Principle / Criterion / Indicator / Verifier	Proposal for amendment / deletion / addition	Reasons for proposed amendment / deletion / addition	Proposed wording for amendment / addition
Indicator 3.1.1	Drop Verifier 'Records of customary rights of indigenous peoples' lands under the Aboriginal Peoples Act, 1954.'	Enhance Verifier with clearer evidence.	<p>cultural, religious sites, water intake point)</p> <p>Additional Verifier:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Records of customary rights of aborigine's lands under the Aboriginal Peoples Act, 1954 – Sections 2, 3, 6, 7, 8, 10, 11, 12 and 19</li> <li>Maps of Aboriginal Reserve</li> <li>Records of consultations with the aborigines</li> </ul>
Indicator 3.1.2	Drop Verifier 'Records of delegation of power by indigenous peoples.'	Enhance Verifier with clearer evidence.	<p>Replace with Verifier:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Records of consultations of aborigines/natives</li> </ul>
Indicator 3.1.3	Drop Verifier: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Records of outcomes of direct negotiations or arbitration</li> <li>Records of decisions of Civil Courts</li> <li>Records of conflicts and grievances between parties involved</li> </ul>	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<p>Replace with Verifier:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Records of conflicts and grievances between parties involved concerning their legal and customary rights within the forest plantation</li> </ul>

Principle / Criterion / Indicator / Verifier	Proposal for amendment / deletion / addition	Reasons for proposed amendment / deletion / addition	Proposed wording for amendment / addition
			<p>areas, if any</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Records of outcomes by direct negotiations or arbitration concerning their legal and customary rights within the forest plantation area, if any</li> <li>• Records of decisions of Civil Courts concerning their legal and customary rights within the forest plantation areas, if any</li> </ul>
Indicator 3.2.1	Drop Verifier 'Forest Plantation Management Plan.'	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<p>Replace with Verifier: Preventive and mitigation measures incorporated into Forest Plantation Management Plan</p>
Indicator 3.3.1	Drop Verifier 'Forest Plantation Management Plan.'	This Verifier is not related with Indicator 3.3.1	
Indicator 3.3.2	<p>Enhance Verifier:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Dialogue and consultation</li> <li>• Arbitration</li> </ul>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Records of dialogue and consultation held with aborigines and relevant stakeholders, if any</li> </ul>

Principle / Criterion / Indicator / Verifier	Proposal for amendment / deletion / addition	Reasons for proposed amendment / deletion / addition	Proposed wording for amendment / addition
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Civil Courts with proposed wording.</li> </ul>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Records of arbitration</li> <li>Decisions by Civil Court</li> </ul>
Indicator 3.4.2	Enhance Indicator 'Documentation of appropriate mechanisms for consultation and compensation for the commercial utilization of traditional forest-related knowledge and practices of indigenous peoples' with proposed wording.	FDPM does not conduct consultation regarding payment for Orang Asli.	Mechanisms established and records for the commercial utilisation of traditional forest-related knowledge and practices of aborigines, if any
Indicator 4.1.1	Drop Verifier 'Forest Plantation Management Plan.'	Not related with Indicator 4.1.1	
Indicator 4.1.2	Drop Verifier: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Documentation of management commitment</li> <li>Records of efforts to recruit workers from local communities</li> </ul>	Not related with Indicator 4.1.2	
Indicator 4.2.2	Enhance Verifier 'Availability of management policies addressing the occupational safety and health of forest plantation workers and their families' with proposed wording.	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Availability of management policies addressing the occupational safety and health of forest workers and their families in accordance with current legislation and/or regulations.

Principle / Criterion / Indicator / Verifier	Proposal for amendment / deletion / addition	Reasons for proposed amendment / deletion / addition	Proposed wording for amendment / addition
Indicator 4.2.2	Additional Verifier.	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Establishment of Safety and Health Committees in accordance with Occupational Safety and Health Act, 1994 - Sections 30 and 31</li> <li>Employment of Safety and Health Officer in accordance with Occupational Safety and Health Act, 1994 - Section 29</li> </ul>
Indicator 4.2.3	Additional Verifier	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Minutes of Safety and Health Committee meetings
Indicator 4.2.4	Drop Verifier 'Minutes of joint employer-employee meetings.'	This Verifier does not apply to FDPM.	
Indicator 4.3.3	Drop Verifier 'Minutes of joint employer-employee meetings.'	This Verifier does not apply to FDPM.	Replace with Verifier: National Joint Council and Departmental Joint Council
Indicator 4.4.1	Drop Verifier: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) report</li> <li>Social baseline studies / impact</li> </ul>	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Replace with Verifier: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Minutes of meetings of the District Action/Development Committee (Jawatankuasa</li> </ul>



Principle / Criterion / Indicator / Verifier	Proposal for amendment / deletion / addition	Reasons for proposed amendment / deletion / addition	Proposed wording for amendment / addition
	assessment		Tindakan Daerah) • Report on social impact evaluation
Indicator 5.1.1	Enhance Indicator 'Investments and reinvestments shall be made in forest plantation management, including for forest plantation administration, research, human resource development, environmental and social aspects' with proposed wording.	Protection, economic and conservation aspect shall be integrated into this Indicator.	Investments and reinvestments are made in forest plantation management, including for forest administration, research, human resource development, protection, economic, conservation, environmental and social aspects, consistent with the tenure of the forest plantation areas.
Indicator 5.1.1	Enhance Verifier: • Forest Plantation Management Plan • Annual operating and development budget, and expenditure • Annual Work Plan with proposed wording.		• 5-Year Development Plan Budget • Annual operating and development budget including from federal and other sources
Indicator 5.5.1	Drop Verifier: • Procedures to identify and demarcate	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Replace with Verifier: • Forest Plantation

Principle / Criterion / Indicator / Verifier	Proposal for amendment / deletion / addition	Reasons for proposed amendment / deletion / addition	Proposed wording for amendment / addition
	<p>sensitive areas for the protection of soil and water, watercourses and wetlands</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Sensitive areas in the forest plantation identified, classified and mapped</li> </ul>		<p>Management Plan</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Forest Harvesting Plan</li> </ul>
Indicator 5.6.2	Enhance Verifier 'Records of quantity of timber and non-timber forest products harvested' with proposed wording.	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Records of timber and non-timber forest products and quantity harvested under licence in the forest plantation area, if any
Indicator 6.1.1	Enhance Verifier 'Assessment of environmental impacts ...' under Indicator 6.1.1 with proposed wording.	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Environmental impact assessments
Indicator 6.1.2	Enhance Verifier 'Assessment of environmental impacts ...' under Indicator 6.1.2 with proposed wording.	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Environmental impact assessments
Indicator 6.1.3	Drop Verifier 'Forest Plantation Management Plan.'	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Replace with Verifier: Forest Plantation Management Plan with mitigation measures for all impacts identified in the environmental impact

Principle / Criterion / Indicator / Verifier	Proposal for amendment / deletion / addition	Reasons for proposed amendment / deletion / addition	Proposed wording for amendment / addition
Indicator 6.2.1	Drop Verifier: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Guidelines for the identification and protection of rare, threatened and endangered species</li> <li>• Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Report</li> </ul>	Existing Verifier is not clear.	assessment  Replace with Verifier: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Director-General of Forestry's Circulars</li> <li>• Minimum cutting limit for <i>Neobalanocarpus heimii</i> (Chengal) be equaled to or greater than 60 cm dbh</li> <li>• Wildlife Conservation Act, 2010</li> <li>• Records on protection of endangered, rare and threatened forest flora and fauna species, if present</li> <li>• National Tiger Conservation Action Plan, 2008-2020</li> </ul>
Indicator 6.2.2	Drop Verifier: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Guidelines for the establishment of representative conservation and protection areas</li> <li>• Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Report</li> </ul>	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Replace with Verifier: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Buffer strips for permanent streams and rivers in Inland Forest and Peat Swamp Forest of at least 5 m in width on either side of the stream or river, are marked and felling of trees is</li> </ul>

Principle / Criterion / Indicator / Verifier	Proposal for amendment / deletion / addition	Reasons for proposed amendment / deletion / addition	Proposed wording for amendment / addition
			<p>prohibited</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Panduan Penubuhan dan Penyelenggaraan kawasan-kawasan Simpanan Hutan Dara, 1987</li> <li>• Virgin Jungle Reserves</li> <li>• Seed Production Areas</li> <li>• Wildlife Conservation Act, 2010</li> <li>• List of protected species (First Schedule)</li> <li>• List of totally protected species (Second Schedule)</li> <li>• List of fruit trees prohibited for felling</li> </ul>
Indicator 6.2.3	Enhance Verifier 'List of collaborative projects' with proposed wording.	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Collaborative projects, if any
Indicator 6.3.2	Drop Verifier 'Guidelines for the conservation of genetic, species and ecosystem diversity.'	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<p>Replace with Verifier:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• National Policy on Biological Diversity, 1998</li> <li>• Panduan Penubuhan dan Penyelenggaraan kawasan-kawasan Simpanan Hutan</li> </ul>

Principle / Criterion / Indicator / Verifier	Proposal for amendment / deletion / addition	Reasons for proposed amendment / deletion / addition	Proposed wording for amendment / addition
			<p>Dara, 1987</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Manual Perhutanan, 2003 (Forestry Manual, 2003)</li> <li>• Minimum cutting limit for <i>Neobalanocarpus heimii</i> (Chengal) be equal or greater than 60 cm dbh</li> <li>• Seed Production Areas</li> </ul>
Indicator 6.5.1	Drop Indicator 'Availability of forest plantation establishment procedures to avoid loss of top soil nutrients, and soil erosion and compaction from inappropriate use of mechanical and chemical techniques.'	Proposed to drop because it is similar with Indicator 6.5.2	
Indicator 6.5.2	Drop Verifier 'Standard operating procedures for harvesting operations.'	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<p>Replace with Verifier:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Guidelines for Reduced Impact Logging in Peninsular Malaysia, 2003</li> <li>• Garis Panduan Jalan Hutan, 2010</li> <li>• Forest Harvesting Plan</li> </ul>
Indicator 6.5.3	Drop Verifier:	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Replace with Verifier:

Principle / Criterion / Indicator / Verifier	Proposal for amendment / deletion / addition	Reasons for proposed amendment / deletion / addition	Proposed wording for amendment / addition
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Guidelines for forest road layout, construction and maintenance</li> <li>• Harvesting Plan</li> </ul>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Guidelines for Reduced Impact Logging in Peninsular Malaysia, 2003</li> <li>• Garis Panduan Jalan Hutan, 2010</li> </ul>
Indicator 6.5.4	<p>Drop Verifier:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Guidelines for conservation of buffer strips along streams and rivers</li> <li>• Forest Plantation Management Plan</li> </ul>	Existing Verifier is not clear.	<p>Replace with Verifier:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Guidelines for Reduced Impact Logging in Peninsular Malaysia, 2003</li> <li>• Garis Panduan Jalan Hutan, 2010</li> <li>• Forest Harvesting Plan</li> </ul>
Indicator 6.8.1	Drop Verifier 'Cartagena Protocol on Biosafety to the Convention on Biological Diversity, 2000.'	Not related with Indicator 6.8.1	
Indicator 6.9.1	Enhance Indicator 'Forest plantation managers shall carefully document, control and monitor the use of exotic species to avoid adverse ecological impacts' with proposed wording.		Document, control and monitor on the use of exotic species to avoid adverse ecological impacts.
Indicator 6.10.1	Add Verifier	'Director-General of Forestry's Circular' as new Verifier.	Director-General of Forestry's Circular

<b>Principle / Criterion / Indicator / Verifier</b>	<b>Proposal for amendment / deletion / addition</b>	<b>Reasons for proposed amendment / deletion / addition</b>	<b>Proposed wording for amendment / addition</b>
Indicator 6.10.2	Add Verifier	'Director-General of Forestry's Circular' as new Verifier.	Director-General of Forestry's Circular
Indicator 7.1.1	Enhance Indicator 'Implementation of forest plantation management plan covering items (a) to (i) in Criterion 7.1, and prepared in accordance with existing guidelines and the provisions listed in Principle 1' with proposed wording.	Existing Indicator is not understandable.	Availability and implementation of Forest Plantation Management Plan.
Indicator 7.3.1	Enhance Verifier 'List of training facilities and programmes conducted and/or attended' with proposed wording.		Training facilities and programmes of the Forestry Department Peninsular Malaysia
Indicator 7.4.1	Enhance Verifier 'Summary of the Forest Plantation Management Plan made publicly available' with proposed wording.		Public summary of the Forest Plantation Management Plan
Indicator 8.3.1	Drop Verifier 'Felling, extraction and transportation records.'	This Verifier is not related to Indicator 8.3.1	
Indicator 8.4.1	Drop Verifier: • Revised Forest Plantation Management Plan	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Replace with Verifier: Relevant results of monitoring activities shall be incorporated

Principle / Criterion / Indicator / Verifier	Proposal for amendment / deletion / addition	Reasons for proposed amendment / deletion / addition	Proposed wording for amendment / addition
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Monitoring reports</li> </ul>		into the revision of the Forest Plantation Management Plan
Indicator 9.1.1	Enhance Indicator 'Forest plantation managers shall conduct an assessment to identify High Conservation Value Forests (HCVFs) in accordance with relevant guidelines, appropriate to scale and intensity of management for forest plantation areas, and in consultation with relevant stakeholders and experts' with proposed wording.	At this stage, experts are not needed as stakeholder.	Forest plantation managers shall determine the presence of HCVF attributes in the forest plantation areas in accordance with relevant federal, state and local laws, appropriate to the level and intensity of forest management operations in the forest plantation areas, and in consultation with relevant stakeholders.
	Drop Verifier: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Report on the assessment, identification and demarcation on maps of HCVFs in the Forest Plantation Management Plan</li> </ul>	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Replace with Verifier: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Report on assessment, identification and demarcation on maps of HCVFs</li> <li>Record of consultations with relevant stakeholders</li> </ul>
Indicator 9.2.1	Drop Verifier 'Records of meetings/dialogues with relevant stakeholders and experts regarding the	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Replace with Verifier: Evidence of consultation/Records of the



Principle / Criterion / Indicator / Verifier	Proposal for amendment / deletion / addition	Reasons for proposed amendment / deletion / addition	Proposed wording for amendment / addition
	HCVFs.		comments of the stakeholders
Indicator 9.3.1	Drop Verifier 'HCVF areas are mapped and incorporated into the Forest Plantation Management Plan and demarcated on the ground.'	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Replace with Verifier: HCVF areas demarcated on maps in the Forest Plantation Management Plan
Indicator 9.4.2	Drop Verifier: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Revised Forest Management Plan</li> <li>• Monitoring records</li> </ul> Plantation	Existing Verifier is not clear.	Replace with Verifier: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Relevant results and findings of HCVF monitoring activities shall be incorporated into the revision of the Forest Plantation Management Plan</li> </ul>
Indicator 10.2.1	Amend Indicator 10.2.1	Use more coherent wordings.	Forest plantation design and layout shall promote the protection, restoration and conservation of natural forest.
Indicator 10.5.1	Drop Indicator 10.5.1	Requirement in Indicator 10.5.1 is similar to Indicator 10.2.2. Propose to integrate with Indicator 10.2.2	-
Criterion 10.7	Amend Criterion 10.7	Use more coherent wordings.	.... Plantation management have to avoid or reduce the usage of chemical pesticides

Principle / Criterion / Indicator / Verifier	Proposal for amendment / deletion / addition	Reasons for proposed amendment / deletion / addition	Proposed wording for amendment / addition
Criterion 10.8	Additional to Indicator 10.8	Add more coherent wording.	and fertilizers, including their use in nurseries.  Appropriate to the scale and diversity of the operations, monitoring of plantations shall include regular assessment of potential on-site and off-site ecological and social impacts especially on adjacent area, (e.g. natural regeneration, effects on water resources and soil fertility, and impacts on local welfare.....
Indicator 10.8.1	Amend Indicator 10.8.1	Add more coherent wording.	Availability and implementation of programs, appropriate to the scale and diversity of the forest plantation operations, to monitor the potential on-site and off-site ecological and social impacts especially on adjacent area of forest plantation establishment and development.