

**PUBLIC SUMMARY OF ASSESSMENT OF KELANTAN FMU  
FOR FOREST MANAGEMENT CERTIFICATION AGAINST THE REQUIREMENTS OF  
*MC&I(2002)***

---

Date of Public Summary: February 2008

**Certification Body**

Malaysian Timber Certification Council (MTCC)  
19F, Level 19, Menara PGRM  
No. 8, Jalan Pudu Ulu, Cheras  
56100 Kuala Lumpur  
Malaysia  
Tel: 603-92005008  
Fax: 603-92006008  
Email: [info@mtcc.com.my](mailto:info@mtcc.com.my)  
Website: <http://www.mtcc.com.my>

**Assessor**

The assessment of Kelantan FMU for forest management certification against the requirements of the *MC&I(2002)* was conducted by an accredited certification body:

SIRIM QAS International Sdn. Bhd.  
Block 4, SIRIM Complex  
No. 1, Persiaran Dato' Menteri  
P. O. Box 7035  
40911 Shah Alam  
SELANGOR  
Tel: 03-5544 6400/5544 6408  
Fax: 03-5544 6763  
Email: [radziah@sirim.my](mailto:radziah@sirim.my)  
Website: <http://www.sirim-qas.com.my/>

**Assessment Team:**

Dr. S. K. Yap (Lead auditor)  
Dr. Zahid Emby  
Mr. Basri Hamzah

**Verification Assessment:**

Dr. S. K. Yap (Lead auditor)  
Dr. Zahid Emby

**Date of Assessment**

Assessment: 19-28 November 2006  
Verification: 28 October-1 November 2007

## **1. INTRODUCTION**

To qualify for the award of the *Certificate for Forest Management* under the Malaysian Timber Certification Scheme (MTCS) operated by MTCC, a forest management unit (FMU) must comply with the requirements of the *Malaysian Criteria and Indicators for Forest Management Certification* [or in short *MC&I(2002)*] based on an assessment conducted by an independent assessor accredited with the Department of Standards Malaysia, the national accreditation body (AB).

This Public Summary contains general information on the FMU, the assessment process involved, information on the Corrective Action Requests (CARs) raised during the assessment, as well as the decision on certification under the MTCS. Maintenance of the *Certificate* will be dependent upon the ability of the FMU to continue comply with the requirements of the *MC&I(2002)* to be verified through surveillance visits to be conducted annually.

## **2. GENERAL INFORMATION**

### **2.1 Name of the Forest Management Unit (FMU)**

Kelantan FMU

### **2.2 Manager of the FMU (Client)**

Mr. Wan Yusoff Wan Ahmad  
State Director of Forestry

### **2.3 Contact Address**

Kelantan State Forestry Department  
1<sup>st</sup> Floor, Block 5  
Kota Darul Naim  
15503 Kota Bharu  
Kelantan  
Tel: 609-7482140/7481957  
Fax: 609-7445675  
Email: [ppnkel@forestry.gov.my](mailto:ppnkel@forestry.gov.my)  
Website: <http://www.forestry.gov.my/kelantan/index.html>

### **2.4. Size of the FMU (Gazetted Permanent Reserved Forest)**

629,687 ha

### **2.5 Forest Resource**

The total forested area in the State of Kelantan amounts to 894,271 ha which represents 60% of the total land area of the State. Of this total, 629,687 ha have been gazetted as Permanent Reserved Forest (PRF), 155,801 ha categorised as State Land and 108,783 ha designated as a National Park. Of the PRF, some 409,073 ha or 65% have been designated

as production forests to be managed for the sustainable production of both timber and non-timber resources based on the Selective Management System (SMS).

### 3. **ASSESSMENT PROCESS AND CERTIFICATION DECISION**

The assessment of the Kelantan FMU for forest management certification against the requirements of the *MC&I(2002)* was conducted on 19-28 November 2006 by an assessment team comprising of three auditors from SIRIM QAS International Sdn. Bhd. (“SIRIM QAS”). The scope of the assessment was confined to the overall forest management system and practices within the PRFs of the Kelantan FMU.

Based on the assessment, the auditors had identified several aspects of the forest management practices which were deemed not in compliance with the *MC&I(2002)*, resulting in the issuance of one (1) Major and eleven (11) Minor Corrective Action Requests (CARs).

The draft *Report on Assessment of Kelantan Forest Management Unit for Forest Management Certification* prepared by SIRIM QAS was subjected to the Client’s comment as well as a review process by two Peer Reviewers, and the outcome of which were submitted for the consideration of the assessor in finalizing the assessment report. The finalized Assessment Report [Ref: MF 003001 dated 26 June 2007] prepared by SIRIM QAS incorporating the comments of the Client and two Peer Reviewers, were tabled for the consideration and decision of MTCC’s Certification Committee during its Thirty-Sixth Meeting on 6 July 2007. As a Major CAR was issued, the Committee concurred with the recommendation made by SIRIM QAS that the Kelantan FMU was not eligible to be awarded a new *Certificate for Forest Management* against the requirements of the *MC&I(2002)*.

The Kelantan State Forestry Department was therefore requested to take the appropriate actions to address the Major and Minor CARs raised and inform MTCC once actions have been taken so that a verification assessment by the independent assessor to close-out the Major CAR could be undertaken.

The verification assessment of Kelantan FMU to address the Major and Minor CARs was conducted by SIRIM QAS on 28 October -1 November 2007. As a result of the verification assessment, a total of one Major and five Minor CARs were closed-out. As the remaining six Minor CARs do not preclude the FMU from being recommended for certification, SIRIM QAS has recommended that the Kelantan FMU be issued with a new *Certificate for Forest Management* against the requirements of the *MC&I(2002)*.

The *Report on the Verification Assessment of Kelantan FMU for Forest Management Certification* [Ref: MF 003001 dated 17 December 2007] was tabled for the consideration of the Forty-Third Meeting of the MTCC Certification Committee held on 18 January 2008. The Certification Committee concurred with the recommendation made by SIRIM QAS and agreed to issue a new *Certificate for Forest Management* to the Kelantan FMU which will supersede the existing *Certificate* issued against the requirements of the *MC&I(2001)*.

The Committee also agreed that the new *Certificate for Forest Management* issued to the Kelantan FMU will be valid for five years with surveillance visits carried out every twelve months to ensure continued compliance to the requirements of the *MC&I(2002)*.

A summary of the CARs raised and their closed-out details is as shown in **Table 1**.

**Table 1: Summary of Corrective Action Requests (CARs)**

<b>CAR No.</b>	<b>Principle</b>	<b>Indicator</b>	<b>Status of CAR</b>	<b>Nature of CAR</b>	<b>Close-Out Details</b>
KEL-01	3: Indigenous Peoples' Rights	3.3.1: Availability of appropriate procedures within current administrative processes for identifying and protecting such sites and provisions for rights of access to these sites by indigenous people within relevant national and state legal frameworks or by mutual agreement.	Minor	There are no appropriate procedures for identifying and protecting sites of cultural, economic or religious significance and also provisions for rights of access to these sites for the indigenous people.	<p>During the verification, a map of Lojing area identifying old graves in Kg. Sigar was provided to the auditors. The District Forest Officer had also written to the Department of Orang Asli Affairs (JHEOA) requesting for a listing of areas of cultural, religious and economic significance. Similar action had also been taken by the West Kelantan District Forest Office.</p> <p><b>Minor CAR KEL-01 was closed-out on 1 November 2007.</b></p>
KEL-02	4: Community relations and worker's rights	4.2.4: Forest managers should maintain up-to-date safety records in compliance with all applicable laws and/or regulations covering health and safety of forest workers.	Minor	There is no documentation of health and safety records of contract workers in the logging operation.	<p>A form has been designed to capture information on the health and safety of workers (<i>Borang Laporan Kesihatan dan Keselamatan Perkerja Perkerja Sektor Pembalakan</i>) for logging contractors. This reporting is to be done on a monthly basis.</p> <p><b>Minor CAR KEL-02 was closed-out on 1 November 2007.</b></p>
KEL-03	4: Community relations and worker's rights	4.4.1: Forest managers should evaluate, through consultations, social impact of forest operations directly affecting communities, and the people and groups directly	Minor	There is no evaluation of social impacts of forest operations directly affecting communities through consultations and they do not have access to information on the social impact evaluation.	<p>The 3 forest districts have developed a set of questionnaire with open-ended questions as a guide for collecting information on possible and potential social impacts of forest logging operations on the local communities.</p>

		affected by the forest operations should have access to information on the results of the social impact evaluations.			<b>Minor CAR KEL-03 was closed-out on 1 November 2007.</b>
KEL-04	4: Community relations and worker's rights	4.4.2: Forest planning and management practices should consider and incorporate the results of such evaluations.	Minor	Forest planning and management practices have not considered and incorporated results of evaluations of social impacts.	There is now a process of gathering information on issues raised or discovered during consultations with local communities. This information is then incorporated into planning and management practices as shown in East Kelantan Forest District, which has incorporated the Department of Irrigation and Drainage (JPS) specifications on water quality in the license issued to logging contractors.  <b>Minor CAR KEL-04 was closed-out on 1 November 2007.</b>
KEL-05	6: Environmental Impact	6.1.1: Assessment of environmental impacts are carried out, including landscape level considerations, as well as the impacts of on-site processing facilities, appropriate to the scale and intensity of forest management, prior to commencement of forest operations in the PRFs for Peninsular Malaysia and forest	Minor	Assessment of environmental impacts of forest operation has not been conducted but arrangement had been made with University Putra Malaysia to work on an EIA for the FMU.	Only inception reports were presented during the verification visit. The EIA will have to be presented during the next surveillance visit.  <b>Minor CAR KEL-05 remains outstanding.</b>

		management areas for Sabah and Sarawak.			
KEL-06	6: Environmental Impact	6.1.3: Forest management plans should incorporate measures to mitigate the environmental impacts identified in the assessments.	Minor	The Forest Management Plan has not incorporated measures to mitigate environmental impacts as these have yet to be identified in the EIA study.	The mitigation measures to be incorporated shall be assessed in the next surveillance visit.  <b>Minor CAR KEL-06 remains outstanding.</b>
KEL-07	6: Environmental Impact	6.5.2: Implementation of reduced/low impact logging to minimize damage to the environment.	Major	Reduced Impact Logging (RIL) specifications had not been fully implemented in the establishment of skid trails. Deep blading of skid trails had resulted in roots of trees being exposed. Steep banks of feeder roads not constructed in accordance with specifications of RIL.	Inspection was conducted in the three forest districts during the verification with attention focused on the construction of feeder roads and skid trails. The 10 feeder roads and 30 skid trails inspected were found to be in accordance with the specifications of the RIL.  <b>Major CAR KEL-07 was closed-out on 1 November 2007.</b>
KEL-08	8: Monitoring and Assessment	8.1.2: Forest managers should identify and implement appropriate monitoring procedures, in accordance with the scale and intensity of the forest management operations, for assessing social, ecological, environmental and economic impacts.	Minor	Forest managers have not identified and implement appropriate monitoring procedures for social and economic impacts.	To be verified during the surveillance visit as only South Kelantan Forest District has developed a questionnaire to monitor social and economic impacts of forest harvesting.  <b>Minor CAR KEL-08 remains outstanding.</b>
KEL-09	9: Maintenance of High	9.2.1: Forest managers should provide the	Minor	A comprehensive list of all relevant stakeholders who had	The list of stakeholders consulted for all the HCVF sites had not been presented

	Conservation Value Forests	assessors with a list of relevant stakeholders who have been consulted regarding the HCVFs.		been consulted was not made available.	during the verification.  <b>Minor CAR KEL-09 remains outstanding.</b>
KEL-10	9: Maintenance of High Conservation Value Forests	9.3.1: Measures to demarcate, maintain and/or enhance the HCVF attributes are documented in the forest management plan and effectively implemented.	Minor	Measures to demarcate, maintain and enhance HCVF attributes are not documented in the draft Forest Management Plan.	A map of the FMU with HCVF sites marked was made available during the verification.. There is, however, a need to maintain management records for each identified site.  <b>Minor CAR KEL-010 remains outstanding.</b>
KEL-11	9: Maintenance of High Conservation Value Forests	9.3.1: These measures should be included in the forest management plan summary made available to the public.	Minor	Public summary of the Forest Management Plan with HCVF measures not available.	The public summary provided in the web page of the FMU has included measures for maintenance and enhancement of conservation measures.  <b>Minor CAR KEL-11 was closed-out on 1 November 2007.</b>
KEL-12	9: Maintenance of High Conservation Value Forests	9.4.1: Forest managers should conduct, appropriate to scale and intensity of forest management operations, annual monitoring to assess the effectiveness of the measures in the management of the HCVFs in the PRFs for Peninsular Malaysia and forest management areas for Sabah and Sarawak.	Minor	Annual monitoring of HCVF has yet to be initiated.	Some monitoring procedures have been presented in the Management Plan for Gunong Stong State Park. These procedures shall be implemented and records of the process be maintained. These will be further inspected during the surveillance visit.  <b>Minor CAR KEL-12 remains outstanding.</b>