

**PUBLIC SUMMARY OF ASSESSMENT OF SELANGOR FMU  
FOR FOREST MANAGEMENT CERTIFICATION AGAINST THE REQUIREMENTS OF  
*MC&I(2002)***

---

Date of Public Summary: June 2008

**Certification Body**

Malaysian Timber Certification Council (MTCC)  
19F, Level 19, Menara PGRM  
No. 8, Jalan Pudu Ulu, Cheras  
56100 Kuala Lumpur  
Malaysia  
Tel: 603-9200 5008  
Fax: 603-9200 6008  
Email: [info@mtcc.com.my](mailto:info@mtcc.com.my)  
Website: <http://www.mtcc.com.my>

**Assessor**

The assessment of the Selangor FMU for forest management certification against the requirements of the *MC&I(2002)* was conducted by an accredited certification body:

SGS (Malaysia) Sdn. Bhd. ("SGS")  
Unit 10-1  
10<sup>th</sup> Floor, Bangunan Malaysian Re  
No 17 Lorong Dungun  
Damansara Heights  
50490 Kuala Lumpur  
Malaysia  
Tel: 603-20959200  
Fax: 603-20959611  
Email: [amargit\\_singh@sgs.com](mailto:amargit_singh@sgs.com)  
Website: <http://www.sgs.com>

**Assessment Team:**

Mr. Salahudin Yaacob (Lead Auditor)  
Mr. Kishokumar Jeyaraj  
Dr. Lim Hin Fui

**Verification Visit:**

Mr. Salahudin Yaacob (Lead Auditor)  
Dr. Lim Hin Fui  
Mr. Abdul Haye Semail

**Date of Assessment**

Assessment: 13-17 November 2006  
Verification Visit: 7-9 & 11 January 2008

## **1. INTRODUCTION**

To qualify for the award of the *Certificate for Forest Management* under the Malaysian Timber Certification Scheme (MTCS) operated by MTCC, a forest management unit (FMU) must comply with the requirements of the *Malaysian Criteria and Indicators for Forest Management Certification* [or in short *MC&I(2002)*] based on an assessment conducted by an independent assessor accredited with the Department of Standards Malaysia, the national accreditation body (AB).

This Public Summary contains general information on the FMU, the assessment process involved, information on the Corrective Action Requests (CARs) raised during the assessment, as well as the decision on certification under the MTCS. Maintenance of the *Certificate* will be dependent upon the ability of the FMU to continue comply with the requirements of the *MC&I(2002)* to be verified through surveillance visits to be conducted annually.

## **2. GENERAL INFORMATION**

### **2.1 Name of the Forest Management Unit (FMU)**

Selangor FMU

### **2.2 Manager of the FMU (Client)**

Tn. Hj. Nor Akhirrudin Mahmud  
Director

### **2.3 Contact Address**

State Forestry Department, Selangor  
3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Podium Utara  
Bangunan Sultan Salahuddin Abdul Aziz Shah  
40660 Shah Alam  
Tel: 603-55191957  
Fax: 603-55102358  
Email: [akhirrudin@forestry.gov.my](mailto:akhirrudin@forestry.gov.my)  
Website: [http://sel\\_forestry.selangor.gov.my/bm/intro\\_page/main\\_page.htm](http://sel_forestry.selangor.gov.my/bm/intro_page/main_page.htm)

### **2.4 Size of the FMU**

241,568 ha

### **2.5 Forest Resource**

As of December 2007, the total forested land in the State of Selangor amounted to 248,289 ha which represents 31% of the total land area of the state. Of this total, 241,568 ha or 97% are gazetted as permanent reserved forests (PRF). In terms of forest types, the PRF comprises 140,729 ha of Dry Inland Forest, 81,458 ha of Peat Swamp Forest, 18,088 ha of Mangrove Forest and the balance of 11,381 ha of forest plantations. The FMU also has 6,721 ha of forest designated as Wildlife Reserve.

### 3. ASSESSMENT PROCESS AND CERTIFICATION DECISION

The assessment of the Selangor FMU for forest management certification against the requirements of the *MC&I(2002)* was conducted on 5-9 March 2006 by an assessment team comprising of three auditors from SGS (Malaysia) Sdn. Bhd. (“SGS”). The scope of the assessment was confined to the overall forest management system and practices within the PRFs of the Selangor FMU.

Based on the assessment, the auditors had identified several aspects of the forest management practices which were deemed not in compliance with the *MC&I(2002)*, resulting in the issuance of one (1) Major and thirteen (13) Minor Corrective Action Requests (CARs).

The draft *Report on Assessment of Selangor Forest Management Unit for Forest Management Certification* prepared by SGS was subjected to the Client’s comment as well as a review process by two Peer Reviewers. The client comments and peer review were subsequently submitted to SGS for its consideration in finalizing the Assessment Report.

The finalized Assessment Report [Ref: F122-294 dated 17 August 2007] prepared by SGS incorporating the comments of the Client and two Peer Reviewers, were tabled for the consideration and decision of MTCC Certification Committee during its Fortieth Meeting held on 18 October 2007. As a Major CAR was issued, the Committee concurred with the recommendation made by SGS that the Selangor FMU was not eligible to be awarded a new *Certificate for Forest Management* against the requirements of the *MC&I(2002)*.

The Selangor State Forestry Department was therefore requested to take the appropriate actions to address the Major and Minor CARs raised and inform MTCC once actions have been taken so that verification by the independent assessor to close-out the single Major CAR could be undertaken.

The verification of Selangor FMU to address the Major and Minor CARs was conducted by SGS on 7-9 and 11 January 2008. As a result of the verification, a total of one Major and six Minor CARs were closed-out, seven Minor CARs remained outstanding and two new Minor CARs issued. As the remaining Minor CARs do not preclude the FMU from being recommended for certification, SGS has recommended that the Selangor FMU be issued with a new *Certificate for Forest Management* against the requirements of the *MC&I(2002)*.

The *Report on Verification of Selangor FMU for Forest Management Certification* [Ref: F122-345 dated 5 June 2008] was tabled for the consideration of the Forty-Ninth Meeting of the MTCC Certification Committee held on 30 June 2008. The Certification Committee concurred with the recommendation made by SGS and agreed to issue a new *Certificate for Forest Management* to the Selangor FMU.

The Committee also agreed that the new *Certificate for Forest Management* issued to the Selangor FMU will be valid for five years with surveillance visits carried out every twelve months to ensure the continued compliance to the requirements of the *MC&I(2002)*.

A summary of the CARs raised and their closed-out details is as shown in **Table 1**.

**Table 1: Summary of Corrective Action Requests (CARs)**

CAR No.	Principle	Indicator	Status of CAR	Nature of CAR	Close-Out Details
SEL-001	3: Indigenous Peoples' Rights	3.3.1: Availability of appropriate procedures within current administrative processes for identifying and protecting such sites and provisions for rights of access to these sites by indigenous people within relevant national and state legal frameworks or by mutual agreement.	Minor	Lack of assessment and documentation of special sites (cultural, ecological, economic and religious sites) within the FMU.	The FMU managers at the district levels are aware of the presence of special sites and the sites were not affected by forest operations. The Mid-term review of the Forest Management Plan included a map on Orang Asli settlements / villages within the Selangor FMU. However there was no assessment/documentation of special sites at the FMU level.  <b>Minor CAR SEL-001 is maintained.</b>
SEL-002	4: Community Relations and Worker's Rights	4.1.1: Forest managers provide, where appropriate, support for training, retraining, local infrastructure, facilities and social programs commensurate with the scale and intensity of forest management operations.	Minor	Lack of training programme for local communities and contract workers to participate in forestry activities and operations.	A training programme for local community was organised involving Orang Asli in Kg Kuang on 27 December 2007 and more training for local communities are being planned. The Selangor Forestry Department maintains close cooperation with other agencies such as Department of Aboriginal Peoples Affairs (JHEOA) and Department of Occupational Safety and Health (DOSH).  <b>Minor CAR SEL-002 was closed on 11 January 2008.</b>
SEL-003	4: Community Relations and Worker's Rights	4.2.2: Availability of management policies addressing the health and safety of forest workers and their families in accordance with current legislation and/or regulations.	Minor	Inadequate awareness on the part of the contractor to comply with health and safety requirement.	Briefings on safety and health conducted for contractors and posters on safety and health displayed at logging camps. First aid facilities, fire extinguisher and other safety equipment were also available at logging camps. Forestry workers operating in the field were observed to use personal protection equipment (PPEs).

SEL-004	4: Community Relations and Worker's Rights	4.2.5: Demarcation of hazardous areas and provision of guidelines for storage and handling of hazardous materials.	Minor	Lack of guidelines and implementation for storage and handling of hazardous materials.	<p><b>Minor CAR SEL-003 was closed on 11 January 2008.</b></p> <p>Guidelines for safe and effective use of pesticides were documented and distributed. New chemical storage area were constructed in the nursery. PPEs for chemical handlings are also available.</p> <p><b>Minor CAR SEL-004 was closed on 11 January 2008.</b></p>
SEL-005	4: Community Relations and Worker's Rights	4.4.1: Forest managers should evaluate, through consultations, social impact of forest operations directly affecting communities, and the people and groups directly affected by the forest operations should have access to information on the results of the social impact evaluations.	Minor	Inadequate documentation on social elements within the planning documents at the FMU, district and Forest Reserve levels.	<p>Even though the FMU managers at the district levels are now more aware of social impact of forest operations, there is still inadequate documentation on social elements within the planning documents.</p> <p><b>Minor CAR SEL-005 is maintained.</b></p>
SEL-006	5: Benefits from the Forest  6: Environmental Impact  7: Management Plan	5.3.1: Availability and implementation of guidelines for reduced/low impact logging to minimize damage to residual stand.  6.5.2: Implementation of reduced/low impact logging to minimize damage to the environment.  7.3.2: Forest workers should be trained as to their	Minor	Inconsistencies in the implementation of RIL guidelines for harvesting of peat swamp forest.	<p>It was observed that there were still inconsistencies in the implementation of RIL guidelines during harvesting of Peat Swamp forest in Sungai Karang FR using canal system. Deviation from the plan was identified where side tracks were constructed perpendicular to the skid trails and unnecessary damage to residual stands observed. The Selangor Forestry Department has taken action to suspend the license until remedial actions have been taken.</p> <p><b>Minor CAR SEL-006 is maintained.</b></p>

SEL-007	5: Benefits from the Forest	respective roles in the implementation of the forest management plan. 5.6.1: Rate of harvest shall not be greater than estimated regrowth of the residual stand based on permanent sample plots within a pre-defined cutting cycle.	Minor	Lack of records on measurement of growth and yield based on Permanent Sample Plots (PSPs) at the FMU level for the establishment of relationship between annual volume removed and mean commercial annual increment (MCAI). The MCAI is based on national average and not determined based on analysis of measurements from PSPs.	The results of inventory and monitoring of nine growth plots in Selangor FMU are maintained and adequately analysed. Post Felling inventory records available and field evaluation showed that the data are reliable  <b>Minor CAR SEL-007 was closed on 11 January 2008.</b>
SEL-008	6: Environmental Impact	6.1.1: Assessment of environmental impacts are carried out, including landscape level considerations, as well as the impacts of on-site processing facilities, appropriate to the scale and intensity of forest management, prior to commencement of forest operations in the PRFs for Peninsular Malaysia and forest management areas for Sabah and Sarawak.	Minor	No environmental evaluation/assessment at the FMU level that identifies the potential impacts and mitigation measures to be taken to minimize the identified impacts.	No environmental impact assessment (EIA) has been carried out but the mid term review of the FMP contains some conceptual brief and the allocation of budget for engaging a consultant to conduct the EIA at the macro level.  <b>Minor CAR SEL-008 is maintained.</b>
SEL-009	6: Environmental Impact	6.6.1: Availability and implementation of guidelines and/or procedures on the use of chemicals in the forest approved by relevant regulatory authorities. 6.6.2: Forest workers should be	Minor	There was no listing of chemicals that are used in the FMU.	The list of chemicals used in the Selangor FMU is now available together with its inventory and records of stock.  <b>Minor CAR SEL-009 was closed on 11 January 2008.</b>

SEL-010	6: Environmental Impact	aware of the procedures on the use of approved chemicals in the forest. 6.7.2: Containers, liquid and solid non-organic wastes including fuel and oil should be disposed of in an environmentally appropriate and legal manner.	Minor	Inadequate management prescription and implementation of waste management and handling of diesel and other liquid materials inside the FMU.  <b>Minor CAR SEL-010 was closed on 11 January 2008.</b>	Efficient handling of domestic and hazardous waste including fuel storage at the forest camp both in Dry Inland and Peat Swamp Forests were observed during the verification.
SEL-011	7: Management Plan	7.1.1: Implementation of forest management plan prepared in accordance with existing regional guidelines and relevant provisions listed in Principle #1 covering items (a) to (i) in Criterion 7.1.  7.2.1: Implementation of procedures to periodically revise the forest management plan, incorporating the results of monitoring or new scientific and technical information, the frequency of which should be appropriate to the scale and intensity of forest management operations, so as to respond to changing environmental, social and economic circumstances.	Major	No mid term review of the 10-year Forest Management Plan (FMP).  <b>Major CAR SEL-011 was closed on 11 January 2008.</b>	During the verification, a mid term review of the FMP containing description on the latest status of the FMU, available resources, revised annual allowable cut (AAC) both for Dry Inland and Peat Swamp Forest, environmental impact assessment, HCVF as well as timber plantation strategic plan were made available. The document also includes social and environmental elements of the FMU and its operation, maps and comparison of achievement, analysis of out put and planned and achieved physical targets. Orang Asli villages and settlements were also identified and mapped.

SEL-012	7: Management Plan 8: Monitoring and Assessment	7.4.1: A summary of the primary elements of the forest management plan as prepared and implemented under Indicator 7.1.1 should be made available to the public. 8.5.1: A summary of the results of monitoring indicators, including those listed in Criterion 8.2, should be made available to the public.	Minor	No public summary of the FMP and the results of monitoring indicators.	The summary of the FMP is available but has yet to be updated based on the revised FMP and made publicly available. <b>Minor CAR SEL-012 is maintained.</b>
SEL-013	8: Monitoring and Assessment	8.1.2: Forest managers should identify and implement appropriate monitoring procedures, in accordance with the scale and intensity of the forest management operations, for assessing social, ecological, environmental and economic impacts. 8.2.1: Forest managers should gather the relevant information, appropriate to the scale and intensity of the forest management operations, needed to monitor the items (a) to (e) listed in Criterion 8.2.	Minor	Lack of monitoring procedures and implementation to assess social, and economic impacts of forest operation.	The assessment team's visit to Compartment 18, Bukit Belata Forest Reserve, confirmed the use of monitoring Forms A (Infrastructure), B (Forest Harvesting), C (Environment and Protection) and D (Timber Output) in the monthly report for areas being harvested. However, there is still inadequate monitoring procedure to assess the social impacts of forest operations. <b>Minor CAR SEL-013 is maintained.</b>
SEL-014	9: Maintenance of High Conservation Value Forest	9.1.1: Forest managers should conduct an assessment of HCVFs in accordance with relevant national	Minor	There is a lack of assessment, identification and documentation of HCVF within the Selangor FMU carried out in consultation	The revised FMP based on the mid-term review contains conceptual description and screening protocol for identification of HCVF areas. With the gazettement of the

SEL-015	8: Monitoring and Assessment	<p>and regional legal and regulatory frameworks, appropriate to scale and intensity of forest management operations in the PRFs for Peninsular Malaysia and forest management areas for Sabah and Sarawak, and in consultation with relevant stakeholders and experts.</p> <p>9.2.1: Forest managers should provide the assessors with a list of relevant stakeholders who have been consulted regarding the HCVFs.</p> <p>9.3.1: Measures to demarcate, maintain and/or enhance the HCVF attributes are documented in the forest management plan and effectively implemented.</p>	Minor	<p>with relevant stakeholders and expert.</p> <p>Logs in the temporary log yard in the Peat Swamp Forest were not adequately identified with log tag in a timely manner according to the procedures for chain-of-custody.</p>	<p>Heritage Park, 68% of the Selangor FMU is now under protection status. There is a need for a comprehensive description, identification and mapping of the HCVF areas through proper stakeholder consultation for the Selangor FMU.</p> <p><b>Minor CAR SEL-014 is maintained.</b></p>
SEL-016	5: Benefits from the Forest	5.6.2: Rate of harvest shall not be greater than estimated regrowth of the residual stand based on permanent sample plots	Minor	Based on sampling conducted in a number of locations during verification, it was found that in one compartment, i.e. Compt. 82, Sg. Karang FR, the audit team	<p><b>New Minor CAR raised during verification.</b></p> <p><b>New Minor CAR raised during verification.</b></p>

			within a pre-defined cutting cycle.		verified that some trees below cutting limit were marked for felling and a number of untagged trees were felled by the contractor.	
--	--	--	-------------------------------------	--	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--