

**PUBLIC SUMMARY OF ASSESSMENT OF KELANTAN FMU
FOR FOREST MANAGEMENT CERTIFICATION**

Date of Public Summary: March 2004

Certification Body

Malaysian Timber Certification Council (MTCC)
19F, Level 19, Menara PGRM
No. 8, Jalan Pudu Ulu, Cheras
56100 Kuala Lumpur
Malaysia
Tel: 603-92005008
Fax: 603-92006008
Email: mtcc@tm.net.my
Website: <http://www.mtcc.com.my>

Assessor

The assessment/verification of Kelantan FMU for forest management certification was conducted by an independent assessor registered with MTCC:

SIRIM QAS International Sdn. Bhd. ["SIRIM QAS"]
Block 4, SIRIM Complex
1, Persiaran Dato' Menteri
P. O. Box 7035
40911 Shah Alam
Selangor
MALAYSIA
Tel: 603-55446400
Fax: 603-55109439
Email: abd.aziz_long@sirim.my
Website: <http://www.sirim-qas.com.my/>

Assessment Team

Assessment:

Mr. Stephen Smith(Lead Auditor) (from Scientific Certification Systems, Oakland)
Dr. Yap Son Keong
Mr. Samsudin Musa

Verification:

Dr. Yap Son Keong (Lead Auditor)
Mr. Samsudin Musa

Date of Assessment

Assessment: 2-12 September 2002
Verification: 14-15 October 2003 & 8-12 February 2004

1. INTRODUCTION

To qualify for the award of the *Certificate for Forest Management* under the MTCC timber certification scheme, a forest management unit (FMU) must comply with the requirements of the *Malaysian Criteria, Indicators, Activities and Standards of Performance for Forest Management Certification [MC&I]* based on an assessment conducted by an independent assessor registered with MTCC. This Public Summary contains general information on the FMU, the assessment process and certification decision under the MTCC scheme, as well as information on the Corrective Action Request (CAR) raised during the assessment. Maintenance of the Certificate will be dependent upon the ability of the FMU to continue comply with the requirements of the *MC&I* to be verified through surveillance visits conducted once annually.

2. GENERAL INFORMATION

2.1 Name of the Forest Management Unit (FMU)

Kelantan FMU

2.2 Manager of the FMU

Tuan Hj. Dahlan bin Taha

2.3 Contact Address

Kelantan State Forestry Department
1st Floor, Block 5
Kota Darul Naim
15503 Kota Bharu
Kelantan
Tel: 609-7482140/7481957
Fax: 609-7445675
Email: ppnkel@forestry.gov.my
Website: <http://www.forestry.gov.my/kelantan/index.html>

2.4. Size of the FMU (Gazetted Permanent Reserved Forest)

629,687 ha

2.5 Forest Resource

The total forested area in the Kelantan FMU amounts to 894,271 ha. Of this total, 629,687 ha were gazetted as Permanent Reserved Forest (PRF), 108,783 ha as national parks/wildlife reserves, and the remaining 155,801 ha categorized as Stateland Forest.

3. ASSESSMENT PROCESS AND CERTIFICATION DECISION

The assessment process used is as stipulated in the MTCC document entitled *Procedures in MTCC Timber Certification Scheme*.

The assessment for the Kelantan FMU was conducted on 2-12 September 2002 by an assessment team comprising of three auditors from SIRIM QAS. The scope of the assessment was confined to the forests located in the PRF of the Kelantan FMU.

Based on the forest management assessment, the auditors had identified several aspects of the forest management practices which were deemed not in compliance with the requirements of the *MC&I*, resulting in the issuance of three Major and seven Minor Corrective Action Requests (CARs).

The Assessment Report for Kelantan FMU prepared by SIRIM QAS incorporating the comments of the client and two Peer Reviewers, together with the Evaluation Report prepared by the MTCC management were tabled for the consideration and decision of MTCC Certification Committee during its Fifth Meeting held on 18 September 2003.

Based on the recommendations made by SIRIM QAS as the independent assessor, and those by the MTCC management in its Evaluation Report, the Committee agreed that the Kelantan FMU had not fully complied with the requirements of the *MC&I* and was therefore not eligible to be awarded with the *Certificate for Forest Management*.

The Kelantan State Forestry Department was therefore requested to take the appropriate actions to address the Major and Minor CARs raised and inform MTCC once action has been taken so that verification by the independent assessor to close out the three Major CARs could be conducted.

The verification of corrective actions taken by the Kelantan State Forestry Department to address the Major and Minor CARs raised was undertaken by two auditors from SIRIM QAS on 14-15 October 2003 and 8-12 February 2004.

Based on the Verification, three Major and four Minor CARs were closed-out. However, three Minor CARs remained outstanding and two new Minor CARs were issued. Though there are still five Minor CARs, these Minor CARs do not prohibit the FMU from being recommended for certification.

There being no Major CARs, SIRIM QAS has recommended that the Kelantan State FMU be eligible for the *Certificate for Forest Management* to be issued by MTCC.

Based on the verification carried out by SIRIM QAS and SIRIM QAS's recommendation to issue the *Certificate for Forest Management* to the Kelantan FMU, the MTCC Certification Committee during its Eighth Meeting on 5 July 2004 decided to award the *Certificate* to the Kelantan FMU. The *Certificate for Forest Management* bearing certificate No. **FMC 008** dated 5 July 2004 will be valid for five years, with surveillance visits carried out annually to ensure continued compliance to the *MC&I*.

A summary of the CARs raised and their closed-out details is as shown in **Table 1**.

Table 1: Summary of Corrective Action Requests (CARs) and Closed-out Details

CAR No.	Criterion	Indicator	Status of CAR	Nature of CAR	Close-Out Details
KEL-001	3: Flow of Forest Produce	3.3: Existence and implementation of: (a) forest management plans, and (b) forest harvesting (operational) plans.	Major	The main concern is the number of advanced stocking present after logging may not be sufficient to ensure regeneration. The possible cause is the excessive removal of too many trees based on fixed diameter marking system.	<p>Kelantan State Forestry Department had initiated Post-Felling forest inventory trials in Balah FR and Perias FR which showed that there were the required number of trees of 30 to 45 cm dbh remaining after harvesting. This was done in addition to the more comprehensive and systematic approach of showing evidence on the availability of sufficient residuals for the next crop through Post-Felling forest inventories. The Post-Felling forest inventory data undertaken in 2003 were examined to ascertain if sufficient trees (at least 32 trees/ha) of intermediate sizes (more than 30 cm dbh) as required by Selective Management System (SMS) were present. Examination of 40 compartments showed that 38 of them or 95% have sufficient healthy trees remaining in the residual stand.</p> <p>Major CAR KEL-001 was closed-out on 12 February 2004.</p>
KEL-002	3: Flow of Forest Produce	3.6: Availability and implementation of management guidelines for each of the main wood and non-wood forest products to be harvested to cover: (a) the assessment of natural regeneration, and (b) measures to	Minor	There is no comparison of Pre-Felling and Post-Felling forest inventories to ascertain the impact of logging and the quality of the residual stand. The rehabilitation planting of exposed sites is not monitored.	Inspection of the systematic post-felling inventory data undertaken in 2003 to ascertain if sufficient trees (at least 32 trees/ha) of intermediate sizes required by SMS was carried out in the verification visit. After examining data for 40 compartments, it was found that 95% or 38 compartments had sufficient healthy trees remaining in the residual stand. Further analysis was undertaken by comparing with Pre-felling inventory data for 4

		supplement natural regeneration where necessary			compartments selected by the auditors. The results showed that although relatively large number of trees was removed during the harvesting, the residual stand still had at least 32 trees/ha having diameter size greater than 30 cm dbh. Minor CAR KEL-002 was closed-out on 12 February 2004.
KEL-003	3: Flow of Forest Produce	3.7: Availability and implementation of guidelines for reduced/low impact logging to minimise damage to residual stand.	Major	Directional felling was not consistently followed and bufferzones have been infringed by skid trails resulting in high sediment loads in waterways.	The auditors noted the effort of the Kelantan State Forestry Department in ensuring compliance with the requirements of the <i>MC&I</i> through different courses conducted for the loggers and the engagement of at least a qualified tree feller with each contractor. Reduced impact logging was observed to be more strictly adhered to thus minimizing damages to buffer belts. Road conditions had generally been enhanced. Major CAR KEL-003 was closed-out on 12 February 2004.
KEL-004	4: Biological Diversity	4.3: Existence and implementation of procedures for assessing changes of biological diversity of the production forests, compared with areas in the same forest type kept free from human intervention	Minor	Virgin Jungle Reserves (VJRs) are not established according to the Management Plan while many old VJRs have been infringed on.	It was observed that effort had been made in improving the protection of existing VJRs and selection process of new VJRs had been initiated with sites surveyed. Documentation of three potential sites was shown to the auditors during the verification. It is recommended that this Minor CAR should remain outstanding to ensure that continued efforts be undertaken by the Kelantan State Forestry Department in identifying and establishing new VJRs as advocated in the FMP. Minor CAR KEL-004 remains outstanding.

KEL-005	4: Biological Diversity	4.3: Existence and implementation of procedures for assessing changes of biological diversity of the production forests, compared with areas in the same forest type kept free from human intervention	Minor	Records of field inspection showed that many of the VJRs have been damaged by encroachment. No monitoring and protective measures for VJRs.	Inspection of a VJR had shown that actions were taken by the Forestry Department to improve protection through proper signage and clear boundary demarcation with regular patrols. Documentation for contracting out boundary clearing for other VJRs was observed. Minor CAR KEL-005 was closed-out on 12 February 2004.
KEL-006	4: Biological Diversity	4.1: Existence and implementation of procedures to identify endangered, rare and threatened species of forest flora and fauna.	Minor	Rare and threatened species that are in the IUCN list are not efficiently protected.	Effort initiated in establishing a protection plot and joint research with a local university for protecting the <i>Rafflesia</i> is a first step towards establishing a procedure for the protection of endangered, rare or threatened flora and fauna. The Scientific Expedition to Gunung Stong would also provide a guideline to the identification of these species in the forest. However, as there is still no established procedure for the protection of endangered, rare and threatened flora and fauna, it is recommended that this Minor CAR be maintained as outstanding so that the efforts initiated thus far could be maintained and continued to be monitored in subsequent assessments. Minor CAR KEL-006 remains outstanding.
KEL-007	5: Soil and Water	5.3: Percentage of length of edges of water courses, water bodies, mangroves and other wetlands protected by adequate buffer strips.	Major	Infringement of the buffer belts along waterways had been detected during audit. Skid trails are constructed near waterways thus not following accepted guidelines.	The field inspection had observed greatest degree of consciousness in maintaining the buffer belts. The awareness was observed in the Kelantan State Forestry Department staff and the contractors operating in the field. During the field inspection, it was observed that greater effort had been taken to have river buffers marked out with

					<p>yellow paint on the border trees as seen in Lojing FR, Nenggiri FR and Balah FR. A minimum 10 m (1 chain) width has been maintained in the sites visited.</p> <p>Major CAR KEL-007 was closed-out on 12 February 2004.</p>
KEL-008	5: Soil and Water	<p>5.6 Availability and implementation of harvesting procedures:</p> <p>(a) to protect the soil from compaction by harvesting machinery, and</p> <p>(b) to protect the soil from erosion during harvesting operations</p>	Minor	<p>Construction of skid trails need to be improved to prevent excessive soil erosion. Rehabilitation by planting was observed to be not successful as the newly established seedlings in the poor soil were not able to grow fast enough to prevent erosion.</p>	<p>The FMU had made sufficient efforts in ensuring that harvesting procedures for protecting soil compaction and erosion were understood by contractors by enhancing capacities through training. Road densities were in accordance with the requirements of the <i>MC&I</i> and in general road construction had improved. It was noted that erosion control is contained in the Road Specification for Logging and relevant sections have been incorporated in the Harvesting Plans as of 20 June 2003.</p> <p>Minor CAR KEL-008 was closed-out on 12 February 2004.</p>
KEL-009	5: Soil and Water	<p>5.5 Availability and implementation of guidelines for forest road layout, including drainage requirement and conservation of buffer strips along streams and rivers.</p>	Minor	<p>Responsibility of access roads in some compartments which are used by many parties is not clear resulting in severe damages and absence of service. These roads require long-term erosion control and maintenance ensuring silt traps are cleaned regularly.</p>	<p>Specifications for closing roads are stated in the Guidelines for Logging Roads and incorporated into the Harvesting Plan. The deposit made to the Forest Department had been raised to RM 15,000 and this deposit could only be refunded when all roads were of satisfactory condition following inspection by the District Forest Office. There was also reported action taken to ensure good road condition for shared roads.</p> <p>Minor CAR KEL-009 was closed-out on 12 February 2004.</p>

KEL-010	2: Forest Resource Security	2.2: Length and percentage of external boundaries of the permanent forest estate demarcated or clearly defined.	Minor	Strong efforts need to be undertaken by the FMU to rapidly demarcate external boundaries to prevent encroachment and facilitate management activities.	Steps have been taken to demarcate forest reserve boundaries, and documentation presented had shown that contracts had been issued for boundary clearing and survey works. However, these efforts need to be further intensified as harvesting of state land forest bordering forest reserves is common in Kelantan FMU. It was observed that forest reserve plates are still not placed in H.S. Balah and not clearly visible in H.S. Perias. Hence it is recommended that this Minor CAR should remain outstanding to ensure that these aspects are being addressed and continued to be monitored in subsequent assessment. Minor CAR KEL-010 remains outstanding.
KEL-011	3: Flow of Forest Produce	3.3: Existence and implementation of: (a) forest management plans, and (b) forest harvesting (operational) plans.	Minor	Mother trees are damaged and are located too close to logging roads thus affecting their growth. These trees will be uprooted due to strong wind and soil erosion.	New Minor CAR raised during Verification.
KEL-012	5: Soil and Water	5.5 Availability and implementation of guidelines for forest road layout, including drainage requirement and conservation of buffer strips along streams and rivers.	Minor	Enforcement of road construction and maintenance must be strictly undertaken in accordance with road construction guidelines.	New Minor CAR raised during Verification.